United Nations
Division for the Advancement of Women
Expert Group Meeting on "Equal sharing of responsibilities between women and men, including care-giving in the context of HIV/AIDS"
United Nations Office at Geneva
6-9 October, 2008

# **Background paper**

Equal sharing of responsibilities between women and men, including caregiving in the context of HIV/AIDS

International Labour Organization (ILO) \*

Prepared by Laura Addati and Naomi Cassirer

Division for the Advancement of Women Department of Economic and Social Affairs United Nations, New York Fax: (212) 963-3463 daw@un.org http://www.un.org/womenwatch/daw

<sup>\*</sup> The views expressed in this paper are those of the author and do not necessarily represent those of the United Nations.

## 1. Background: International Labour Standards

Since the first session of the International Labour Conference in 1919, when it adopted the Maternity Protection Convention (No. 3), the ILO has shown its concern about work and family responsibilities. At a much later stage in 1965, a Recommendation was adopted on Women with Family Responsibilities. However, it soon became apparent that many of the Recommendation's measures could be counter productive for women, as they reinforced the concept that women were less committed to work than men because of a responsibility to the family which men did not have. There was a need for recognition of the role of men in the family. This led to the adoption of the Workers with Family Responsibilities Convention, 1981 (No. 156), and the Workers with Family Responsibilities Recommendation, 1981 (No. 165), the latter superseding the previous Recommendation of 1965 (see Annex for full texts).

The core of Convention No. 156 reads as follows:

"With a view to creating effective equality of opportunity and treatment for men and women workers, each Member [State] shall make it an aim of national policy to enable persons with family responsibilities who are engaged or wish to engage in employment to exercise their right to do so without being subject to discrimination and, to the extent possible, without conflict between their employment and family responsibilities"

(Article 3, paragraph 1).

Since the Convention was adopted in 1981, the issues that it addresses – conflict between work and family responsibilities and its implications for equality of opportunity in the labour market – have become increasingly prominent. Reducing inequalities between men and women in the labour market and at home has become a key objective and achieving it clearly requires measures related to family responsibilities and the effects they are having on women. The Workers with Family Responsibilities Convention No. 156 and its accompanying Recommendation No. 165 give considerable guidance on policies and measures which are needed to help workers with family responsibilities and to reduce work–family conflict. To date, 40 countries have ratified Convention No. 156.

# 2. The origins of the problem

# Increasing labour force participation of women, but large share in poorquality employment

Labour markets and policies promoting decent work—productive work in conditions of freedom, equity and security for both women and men—play key roles in reducing poverty and inequality around the world. However, statistics show that access to labour markets and to decent work remains limited, particularly for women. In 2007, 1.2 billion women around the world worked, almost 200 million or 18.4 per cent more than ten years ago. But, the number of unemployed women also grew from 70.2 to 81.6 million over the same period and in 2007, women at the global level still had a higher likelihood of being unemployed than men. The female unemployment rate stood at 6.4 per cent compared to the male rate of 5.7 per cent.<sup>1</sup>

As for women who do find work, they are often confined to work in the less productive sectors of economies and in status groups that carry higher economic risk and a lesser likelihood of meeting the characteristics that define decent work, including access to social protection, basic rights and a voice at work. Also, as a result of the type of work where women can find employment (in terms of both sector and status), they often earn less than men. Whereas ten years ago agriculture was still the main employer for women, the services sector now provides the majority of female jobs: out of the total

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> International Labour Office (2008): Global Employment Trends for Women (Geneva).

number of employed women in 2007, 36.1 per cent worked in agriculture and 46.3 per cent in services. Male sectoral shares in comparison were 34.0 per cent in agriculture and 40.4 per cent in services. The share of women in wage and salaried work grew during the last ten years from 41.8 per cent in 1997 to 46.4 per cent in 2007 while the share working as contributing family workers or own-account workers decreased from 56.1 to 51.7 per cent. Women's share as contributing family workers and own-account workers remains much larger than men's, especially in the world's poorest regions.<sup>2</sup>

## Increasing pressures from long working hours in both paid and unpaid work

Despite the increase in women's participation in paid work, women continue to bear the primary responsibilities for unpaid work in the households, including both the provision of care to family members and domestic tasks. Unpaid family responsibilities encompass the non-economic activities that enable the care and maintenance of every member of society, underpinning societal health and survival.

Time use studies around the world show that women spend considerably more time than men in unpaid tasks related to caring for children and elders, cooking, cleaning, etc. For example, in the Republic of Korea in 1999 women workers spent an average of nearly two and a half hours per day on household tasks and family care, compared with only 25 minutes for male workers.<sup>3</sup> Women in Bolivia spend 35 hours in unpaid work per week compared to 9 hours for men. In contrast, men typically spend more hours in paid economic activities than women—in the case of Bolivia, men spend 42 weekly hours in paid work compared to women's 26. However, the contributions hardly even out: when hours in paid and unpaid work are totalled, women tend to have longer work weeks than men and less time for leisure or sleep.<sup>4</sup>

That women must spend such long hours in unpaid family work is strongly related to their availability for paid economic activities. Unpaid family responsibilities affect whether women can undertake paid work, what type of work, for how long, and where. For example, in Latin America, over half of all non-employed women aged 20 to 24 cite their unpaid household work as the main reason they do not seek paid employment. Even when women do participate in the labour market, family responsibilities affect the amount and type of paid work that women can undertake.

Family responsibilities are one of the reasons women turn to vulnerable and informal employment. For example, 40 percent of mothers working informally in the slums of Guatemala City were caring for their children themselves, with lack of childcare cited as a key reason for not taking formal economy jobs where children could not accompany them. Family responsibilities reportedly steer many women in Costa Rica to domestic work or other types of informal employment that provide a degree of flexibility in working hours. In the Philippines, where more than two-thirds of all women work in the informal economy, 20 percent of women cited family responsibilities as the reason they turned to informal rather than formal employment. In a study of small enterprises in Bangladesh, 13 per cent of women reported family responsibilities as a reason for turning to entrepreneurial activities, compared to less than one per cent of men. In Angola, women participating in the informal economy

<sup>3</sup> Yoon J., cited in Lee, S., D. McCann and J.C. Messenger (2007): Working time around the world: Trends in working hours, laws and policies in a global comparative perspective, Routledge, (Geneva, ILO).
<sup>4</sup> ILO, 2007, op.cit.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> ILO, 2008, op.cit.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> ECLAC, (2007): Social Panorama of Latin America 2006, United Nations Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean, (Santiago).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> International Food Policy Research Institute, (2003): "Guatemala City: A focus on working women and childcare", in IFPRI City Profiles, http://www.ifpri.org/themes/mp14/profiles/guatemalacity.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Ramírez, A.L., and P. Rosés (2005): Conciliation of work and family life: Costa Rica, Unpublished Working Paper, Conditions of Work and Employment Programme, (Geneva, ILO).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Verceles, N.A. and S.N. Beltran (2004): Reconciling work and family. Philippine Country Study, Unpublished Working Paper, Conditions of Work and Employment Programme, (Geneva, ILO).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Marcucci, P. N. (2001): Jobs, gender and small enterprises in Africa and Asia: Lessons drawn from Bangladesh, the Philippines, Tunisia and Zimbabwe, In Focus Programme on Boosting Employment through Small Enterprise Development, Job Creation

do so, in part, for the flexible work hours that enable them to fulfil household and child care responsibilities 10.

At the same time, working conditions that demand long hours in paid work undermine both men's and women's capacities to provide the care required at home, intensifying conflict between economic and care responsibilities. ILO global estimates indicate that about one in five – 22 per cent, or 614.2 million – workers around the world are working more than 48 hours per week. The share of men and women putting in excessive working time is particularly important in a number of countries, where more than 30 per cent of all employees are reported to work more than 48 hours per week, such as: Ethiopia (Total: 41.2%; M: 44.2%; W: 37.3%); Honduras (T: 32.3; M: 31.2%; W: 32.4%); Indonesia (T: 51.2%; M:55.1%; W:42.0%); Republic of Korea (T:49.5%; M: 54.0%; W: 42.6%); Pakistan (T:44.4%; M: 50.9%; W:14.4 %). That men tend to be more likely to work excessive hours is both a consequence of gender stereotypes about men's breadwinner roles and women's care giving roles, but also a cause, reinforcing existing divisions of labour<sup>11</sup>.

## Increasing commuting time

Time spent in travelling to and from work is neither work time nor family time and therefore long journey times make reconciliation of work and family more difficult.

In urban areas of developing countries, particularly in large cities where public transport systems are often inadequate and traffic congestion is increasing, considerable time can be taken commuting, often in uncomfortable conditions. The difficulties in metropolises like Cairo, Bangkok, Delhi, Lagos, Manila, Mexico City and Rio de Janeiro and many others are notorious. Even in smaller cities, traffic congestion seems to be an increasing problem; research mentions this time and distance quandary as a major factor exacerbating work—family conflict in Ankara and Istanbul, for example 12. Irrespective of the type of transport used, whether it is a private car, public transport, a bicycle or walking, travel conditions have become more and more difficult, and workers of different social status lose both time and productivity in commuting.

For women transport can be more difficult than for men, and travel time can often be longer. Women's access to a number of forms of transport is restricted because of social and cultural rules. Generally, women do not have access to private vehicles and are more dependent than men on public transport. In addition, in some societies, men traditionally board buses first, with the consequence that women often do not get on. Using public transport can also be unsafe for women and in some places it can be socially difficult for women to share crowded public transport with men<sup>13</sup>. Recently, the municipal government in Mexico City introduced women-only buses (driven by women and serving only female customers) to reduce the stress and physical and verbal assaults that women are typically exposed to when taking the bus from home to work and back.

## Declining availability of family assistance

For domestic tasks and childcare, many workers in dual-earner couples or single parent situations have traditionally been able to count on help from non-working women relatives and kin (sisters, mothers, aunts, co-wives and sometimes daughters). Indeed, in both developing and industrialized countries, family members, particularly grandmothers, have been a major source of childcare support. However, regular help from grandmothers is relatively rare in industrialized countries. For example, a survey in the United States found that only one in ten working parents had received eight or more

and Enterprise Department, SEED Working Papers: Series on Women's Entrepreneurship Development and Gender in Enterprises – WEDGE, No.58, (Geneva, ILO).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Ceita 1999, cited in González de la Rocha, M. and A. Grinspun (2001): "Private adjustments: Households, crisis and work," in Choices for the poor: Lessons from national poverty strategies, A. Grinspun, ed., United Nations Development Programme, pp. 55-87, (New York, UNDP).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Lee, S., D. McCann and J.C. Messenger, 2007, op.cit.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Moghadam, V.M. (1998): Women, work and economic reform in the Middle East and North Africa (Boulder, CO, Lynne Rienner Publishers).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Peters, D. (1998): "Breadwinners, homemakers, and beasts of burden: A gender perspective on transport and mobility", in Habitat Debate, Vol. 4, No. 2, (Nairobi).

hours of assistance from their parents in the previous month, while eight out of ten had received none. 14

In many developing countries, it is often assumed that almost all workers can solve care problems by appealing to traditional family solidarity and finding a relative who can help. It is considered that families can find their own solutions and there is no need for outside intervention except, perhaps, in cases of very poor families who are unable to cope or whose children may be at risk. In reality, dramatic social changes mean that many women cannot rely on traditional family supports for help with their care responsibilities. Urbanization, internal and international migration have ruptured extended family support networks. At the same time, the growth of single-mother households means that many women are assuming responsibility alone as the economic provider and caregiver for their children. Even when extended families are close by, the capacity of family members to help each other out is weakening, particularly among the poor where economic need compels all adult family members to engage in income earning activities. <sup>15</sup>

Urbanization, the increased labour force participation of women, and migration (both internal and international) mean that traditional family support for care roles and domestic tasks is more difficult to arrange. Grandmothers may no longer live nearby and may themselves be working and unable to look after grandchildren. The extent of this phenomenon has not been fully recognized in some countries where policies continue to be based on the increasingly unrealistic assumption that all families can count on extended family support. Low-income families have the most difficulty since satisfactory market-based care solutions are often beyond their means.

## HIV/AIDS increases burden of care

According to the most recent data (UNAIDS Epidemic Update 2007), 1.7 million people in Sub-Saharan Africa were newly infected with HIV in 2007, bringing the total number to 22.5 million living with HIV, 61% of which are women . More than half of all new infections occur among young people (15-24 years old) who are amidst their productive prime. The escalating risk is especially evident among young women and girls. For the average HIV positive worker, coping with working life is very difficult as he/she struggles not only with the disease, but also discrimination and stigma at the workplace.

For families affected by HIV/AIDS, the situation is often dramatic as caring needs increase at a time when additional income is needed for medical expenses and to compensate for the possible loss of the income of the infected family member. HIV and AIDS-related illnesses of a family member not only mean a loss in income for the person affected, but also often force other family members, mostly women, to give up paid employment or schooling to care for the sick person.

The ILO Programme on HIV/AIDS and the World of Work has estimated the "social burden" for families by considering the change in dependency caused by death and illness of all persons of working age. The ratio relates young and old dependants to working-age persons and is adjusted to take into account persons who are partially or fully unable to work because of AIDS. It thus reflects the increased dependency burden of healthy adults. The estimates indicate that the social burden for families will increase in many African countries affected by HIV/AIDS, as dependency caused by death or illness of persons of working age becomes heavier.

By 2005, the social burden is expected to have grown substantially: by about 10 per cent in Botswana, Lesotho, Swaziland and Zambia, and by 15 per cent in Zimbabwe. In 2015, in the absence of treatment, eight countries will be dealing with greatly increased burdens of dependency; the increase

5

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Heymann, J. (2000): The widening gap (New York, Basic Books).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Gonzalez de la Rocha and Grinspun, op.cit.

is estimated to 30 per cent in Zimbabwe and 12–26 per cent in Botswana, Lesotho, Malawi, Namibia, South Africa, Swaziland and Zambia. 16

HIV-AIDS affects and exacerbates all the dimensions of unpaid work. This example of water collection from Southern Africa effectively illustrates the impact of the pandemic women's care work. "In households where one person is seriously ill with AIDS the amount of water needed daily increases substantially – those infected with HIV may experience five, six, or sometimes continuous episodes of diarrhoea each day. Bedclothes need to be washed. The patient needs to be washed. Clothes need to be washed. Clean drinking water is essential for re-hydration. In the remoter parts of Africa, collecting water can mean walking long distances, and it can take as long as one or two hours to head-carry a heavy load back home". 17

As a consequence of HIV/AIDS, the problem of finding ways to combine paid work with caring for the sick has become a critical issue, with implications for gender inequalities. As the burden of caring for sick persons falls more heavily on women and girls, it adds to their unpaid workload and makes it difficult for women to find and continue in paid employment and for girls to go to school, thus jeopardizing their future. When women's time is spent caring for the sick, they have less time not only for employment but also for other tasks that contribute to the wellbeing of the household, such as growing food. If the mother is ill, girls are even more exposed to the risk of child labour. Poor families, rural families, racial and ethnic minorities are often hit hardest.

## Lack of social care services targeting workers' needs

Reliable and affordable social care services are among the topmost concerns for workers with dependants who must contribute to the economic security of their families while juggling unpaid domestic responsibilities. The importance of social care services for workers with family responsibilities is clearly recognized in ILO Convention No. 156 (1981) and Recommendation No. 165 on Workers with Family Responsibilities, which call upon all Member States to take measures "to develop or promote community services, public or private, such as child-care and family services and facilities (Article 5). However, childcare and health care support for sick people to meet the needs of working parents is a policy priority in relatively few countries. And in many developing countries, strong traditional views persist that care giving is the responsibility of the mother to manage privately with the assistance of their extended families or domestic workers.

As regards to the HIV-AIDS epidemic, health sector responses to increased care burdens resulting from HIV/AIDS have been constrained by structural adjustment programmes (SAPs) that have imposed ceilings on health sector spending and rely on out-of-pocket payments by the users. Restricted civil service budgets have frozen health worker salaries, benefits and recruitment, thus adding a heavy burden on care providers. Difficulty in accessing institutional health care often means that the household, and generally women, have to take on a greater responsibility for caring for the ill or dying. Research shows in fact how women, in particular, have disproportionately suffered from fee-based care provision in countries such as Nigeria, Zimbabwe and Tanzania.<sup>18</sup>

Moreover, with the erosion of traditional supports and the growth in women's labour force participation over the last several decades, very few childcare facilities or services have emerged to address the increased need for care supports. For children below the age of 3, very few childcare services exist. Almost half of the world's countries have no formal programmes for children under 3, and for those that do have programs, coverage is limited. <sup>19</sup> For parents with preschool aged children

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> ILO, (2004): HIV/AIDS and work: Global estimates, impact and response, ILO Programme on HIV/AIDS and the World of Work, (Geneva, ILO).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Urdang, S. (2006): The care economy: Gender and the silent AIDS crisis in Southern Africa, in Journal of Southern Africa Studies, Vol.32, No.1, pp.165-177.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Razavi S. (2007): The return to social policy and the persistent neglect of unpaid care work, in Development and Change, 38 (3): 377-400, Institute of Social Studies.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Education For All (2007): Strong foundations: Early childhood care and education, Global Monitoring Report, (Paris UNESCO).

over the age of 3 or 4, early child care and education (ECCE) programs exist and are expanding in most developing countries, although these too remain uneven in their coverage with little access in particular for poor and rural communities.<sup>20</sup>

Even when ECCE programs are available, they often do not meet the needs of working parents in terms of the hours and duration of programs---most programmes run between 15 and 40 hours per week, with programmes in many countries that run less than 10 hours per week. For parents with school age children, child care remains a problem as the hours of primary and secondary schools are typically shorter than the usual work day, and, in many countries, include a break for lunch during which working parents must find care solutions. School holidays, during which many crèches also close, pose further challenges for working parents. Parents with two or more children can face a host of problems trying to patch together different childcare solutions for the different age-related needs of their children.

# 3. The consequences

The current trends in the work environment and in the family are making it increasingly hard for workers in many countries to reconcile their care responsibilities with the demands of work, as they find themselves caught in a "time–money squeeze". The squeeze can be particularly difficult when public and enterprise policies are blind to the pressures that workers have to deal with.

## Difficult choices and no-win solutions

The lack of measures and supports for balancing paid work and family responsibilities can contribute to considerable conflict between workers' needs to earn a livelihood and the care needs of their household. It is in this context that many households turn to 'individual reconciliation strategies'. Hiring domestic workers is a common solution for many families trying to cope with the lack of childcare. Indeed, domestic work provides millions of jobs throughout the world, in countries at all levels of development. Throughout Latin America, domestic workers are approximately 17 per cent of employed women. They are about 9 per cent of all employed women in South Africa, about 9.5 per cent in the Philippines, and are found in 1 out of every 2 Kenyan homes. For families in middle to high income groups, hiring domestic workers is a key means for overcoming the lack of collective supports for family responsibilities. As we workers is a key means for overcoming the lack of collective supports for family responsibilities.

As an individual reconciliation strategy for work-family in the absence of public supports, this solution comes with its own problems. Domestic workers are predominantly women, often from more vulnerable groups in society—from poor communities, rural areas, ethnic and racial minorities, immigrants. In most countries around the world domestic workers are subject to *de jure* unequal treatment relative to other wage-earners. Moreover, law enforcement is often lax because of, among other reasons, the hidden, "behind the doors" nature of their work. As a result most domestic workers are employed informally, at very low wages, with few legal rights or social protections and little access to voice and representation. Material need and poverty of their own households motivate many women to accept employment as paid domestic workers, but their working conditions prevent many from providing care or spending time with their own families. The large numbers of domestic workers, and the disadvantages and often abusive working conditions that they face around the world, have compelled the Governing Body of the ILO to place a standard-setting activity on domestic workers on the agenda of the International Labour Conference in June 2010. The ILO Conference will have to deliberate on possible international minima standards for these workers and decide what type of international labour instrument(s) would best serve the goal of delivering decent work also to them.

<sup>21</sup> ibid. p.131.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> ibid. p.106.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> ILO (2007): Equality at work: Tackling the challenges. Global Report under the follow-up to the ILO Declaration on Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work, (Geneva, ILO).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Statistical Appendix, OIT. 2007. Panorma Laboral. (Lima, OIT).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> E.g. see Ramírez and Rosés, 2005, op. cit.

Of equal concern is the extent to which older children, usually girls, are employed as childminders, contributing both to child labour and to girls' lower educational opportunities and long term employment prospects. For parents, the lack of training or quality standards for caregivers provides very little assurance of the quality of care their children receive.

Poor households, short of economic resources, have even fewer options for individual reconciliation strategies. For these households, hiring domestic help can be beyond their economic reach, and families may be forced to engage children in paid work and unpaid domestic work in order to enable the family to eke out a livelihood. It is typically girls that are removed from school in poor communities to care for younger children and accomplish domestic tasks, contributing to household survival, but at the expense of long-term education and employment opportunities.

Indeed, the lack of collective measures and supports for unpaid family responsibilities hits poor and vulnerable families the hardest, as they have the weakest economic capacity to purchase goods (processed foods, labour saving devices) or services (private childcare, domestic help) that can free up their time for paid work. For them, work-family conflict severely restricts their options, often forcing them to choose between employment and care, or to combine them, all of which require painful sacrifices in terms of quality of employment and/or quality of care and long-term consequences for escaping poverty.

With no other supports for childcare, poor families cope by leaving children home alone, by enlisting the help of an older sibling, or by taking children to work with them. For example, in Indonesia, 40 per cent of working women care for their children while working; 37 per cent rely on female relatives and 10 per cent deploy older female children to help; in rural areas, reliance on older female children for care is much higher. In Nairobi, 54 per cent of poorer mothers were found to bring their babies to work, whereas 85 per cent of better off mothers had house-girls.

In Vietnam and Botswana, one fourth of poorer parents took their children to work regularly; in the informal economy, half of parents brought their children to work with them on a regular basis.<sup>27</sup> Leaving children alone or in the care of older siblings has clear implications for the quality of care and the health of young children, and for the long-term educational and employment opportunities of the older siblings who withdraw from school to provide care. For those parents that cope by bringing their children to work, most are likely to find informal economy or agricultural employment among their only options.

Bringing children to work may address parents' immediate needs but does not solve their broader work-family concerns. Informal economy employment is often associated with low wages and low productivity requiring long working hours in order to achieve subsistence level earnings—detracting from time and income for workers' families. Having children at work also diminishes from the time and investments that women can put into paid work, including training, market development, registration and expansion.

Vulnerable workers lack the social protections that safeguard them and their children from economic vulnerability arising from illness, job disruption or other events. In some cases, it places children in hazardous environments, for example exposing them to pesticides or extreme weather conditions in agricultural fields or to the dangers of pollution and traffic at markets. Children in the workplace can also contribute to problems of child labour as children in the workplace gradually take on work tasks

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Kamerman, S.B. (2000): "Early Childhood Education and Care (ECEC): An overview of developments", in OECD countries, New York, Columbia University, Institute for Child and Family Policy. Available at http://www.columbia.edu/cu/childpolicy/kamerman.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Lakati A. and al. (2002): "Breastfeeding and the working mother in Nairobi", in Public Health Nutrition, Vol.5, No.6, pp.715-718.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Heymann, J. (2006): Forgotten families: Ending the growing crisis confronting children and working parents in the global economy, (New York, Oxford).

as they grow. With few means for representation, informal economy workers have little chance to voice their needs and improve their lives.

#### Discrimination at work

When society is organized such that family responsibilities conflict considerably with work demands, family responsibilities constitute a disadvantage in the labour market. As recognized in Convention No. 156, the resulting disadvantage may apply to all workers with family responsibilities, whether they are men or women. However, as previously mentioned, despite the fact that women are increasingly employed and "breadwinners", they continue to assume the bulk of family responsibilities in most societies and thus are particularly affected by work–family conflicts.

In theory, if care work were equally shared by men and women, then the labour market disadvantage would apply equally to men and women and family responsibilities would not be a source of gender inequality. However, a significant redistribution of family responsibilities between men and women does not seem to have occurred. Research suggests that even when men spend time on household tasks, they tend to spend much less time than women.<sup>28</sup>

The longer working hours of men in paid work, in turn, may mean that men have less time available for household tasks, thus creating a vicious circle. Cultural conceptions of men's roles no doubt also play an important part. Consequently the labour market disadvantage related to family responsibilities falls mainly on women. The conflict of work with family responsibilities affects both the supply and demand sides of the labour market.

On the supply side, there is a tendency for one member of a couple (usually the man) to try to continue to perform as an "ideal" worker with no family responsibilities while the other member (usually the woman) looks for work options that are more compatible with family responsibilities, such as part-time work, self-employment or home work. Similarly, women may withdraw temporarily from employment with a resultant negative impact on future job opportunities and earnings in labour markets where full-time, continuous employment is the idealized norm and often the reference point for social protection and wage systems.

This labour supply behaviour within a dual-earner couple is particularly encouraged by:

- a lack of affordable and convenient support services such as childcare and adequate health care (which would lighten the demands of family responsibilities); and
- the culture of long hours which makes it very difficult for both partners to have a demanding full-time position.

Similarly, on the demand side, there is a persistent image of women as not being serious about their jobs and careers because of family responsibilities. This is reinforced particularly in contexts where a good-level job with career potential requires an "ideal" worker prepared to put in long hours, while little support is provided for care of dependants. This image may limit the career opportunities of women, even those who are childless: "Even if women are as skilled, clever and talented as men, competitively placed employers will rationally prefer male to female workers if they expect that women, and not men, experience a productivity decline due to childbirth". <sup>29</sup> At the same time, men are under labour market pressure to perform as ideal workers and work long hours leaving little time for family.

Yet men are increasingly expressing concern about the long-hour culture in the workplace and the resulting lack of opportunities to spend more time with their family. In the United Kingdom, for

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> European Foundation for the Improvement of Living and Working Conditions (2007): Fourth European working conditions survey, (Dublin).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Esping-Andersen, G. (2002): "Towards a post-industrial gender contract", in Auer P. and B. Gazier (eds.): The future of work, employment and social protection: The dynamics of change and the protection of workers, pp. 109-128 (Geneva, ILO).

example, eight out of ten fathers complained that hectic work schedules created difficulties in fulfilling family duties and household tasks, but felt forced into longer hours to provide for their children.<sup>30</sup>

Family responsibilities and their conflict with work demands are a major factor contributing to women's disadvantage in the labour market, while work demands and their conflict with family responsibilities are contributing to men's disadvantage in the family and are limiting their ability to be involved in family matters.

# 4. Addressing workers' needs: The policy responses

Policy solutions to facilitate women's access to the labour market and to decent work by explicitly addressing and supporting their unpaid family responsibilities have long been recognized, albeit poorly utilized. Member States of the International Labour Organization established a framework for addressing the needs of workers with family responsibilities in 1981, in the form of the Workers with Family Responsibilities Convention, 1981 (No. 156) and its corresponding Recommendation (No. 165). Convention No.156 represents a flexible tool to support the formulation of policies that enable men and women workers with family responsibilities to exercise their right to engage, participate and advance in employment without discrimination, and to the extent possible, without conflict between employment and family responsibilities.

Convention No.156 covers all workers and all sectors of the economy. The measures that can be taken at the national, community and workplace levels are intended to make family responsibilities more compatible with paid work (e.g. childcare) and to make working conditions more compatible with family responsibilities (e.g. working time and leave measures).

## The role of governments and social partners and existing good practices

Government has a leadership role to play in setting policy orientation and creating a social climate that is favourable to dialogue and change for improving work–family reconciliation. Government creates the legislative and social security context, but much also depends on measures taken within the workplace and within communities.

As Convention No.156 establishes, in designing and implementing work-family measures, workers' and employers' organizations have indispensable roles to play.

Employers' and workers' organizations shall have the right to participate, in a manner appropriate to national conditions and practice, in devising and applying measures designed to give effect to the provisions of this Convention.

(Convention No. 156, Article 11)

Establishing a tripartite national policy framework, encouraging collective bargaining agreements that reinforce and potentially surpass statutory requirements, fostering family-friendly measures in the workplace are proven approaches for ensuring national and workplace policies that are relevant and responsive to the needs of workers and employers.

This section considers the diverse measures to promote work–family reconciliation which fall mainly within the direct means of action of governments and social partners:

- a. Policy research and research supporting promotional efforts
- b. Labour legislation and social security benefits related to leave and working time
- c. Strategies for promoting care facilities

10

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> Daycare Trust (2003): Childcare facts: Men and childcare (London).

- d. Measures to lighten the burden of family responsibilities
- e. Facilitating re-entry into employment
- f. Communication and information to explain measures and encourage change
- g. Promotion of social dialogue and tripartite participation

#### a. Research

The competent authorities and bodies in each country should take appropriate measures [...] to undertake or promote such research as may be necessary into the various aspects of the employment of workers with family responsibilities with a view to providing objective information on which sound policies and measures may be based.

(Recommendation No. 165, Paragraph 11)

As for any other issue, policy development needs to be based on information about needs and preferences. For governments reviewing work–family policies, a first step is to take into account current trends; these can be seen in certain statistics, usually available at national level. Population census or demographic surveys can give information on developing patterns related to marriage, fertility rates, age distribution and household composition. Labour market surveys and population censuses can provide information on labour market participation rates by sex and age, occupations, status in employment, working time, wages and income levels. Household budget surveys can also be a source of information on household composition and incomes. Finally, time-use surveys play a key function in estimating the amount and value of work spent in non-market activities, which are related to the reproduction of the labour force, such as care, preparation of food etc. These non-market activities are not counted in the System of National Accounts (SNA), but are indispensable to society.

Moreover, governments have initiated and sometimes sponsored research on issues such as:

- the nature of work–family conflicts and how families are coping, including their effect on women's labour force participation and equality of opportunity;
- working conditions, including working time and its flexibility, and any benefits currently being offered at the initiative of employers or through collective bargaining agreements;
- good practice in enterprises and links to productivity;
- use of care facilities and their adequacy in terms of quality and demand; and
- worker and employer ideas and preferences concerning solutions.

Extensive research has been carried out in industrialized countries, not only nationally but also at the level of the EU and OECD. University researchers from numerous domains (sociology, psychology, law, industrial relations, economics) have become increasingly interested in issues related to work and family. An example of government/university collaboration for national research is presented in box 1.

#### **Box 1 Examples of policy research**

Chile In Chile, the National Service for Women (SERNAM) undertook a survey of enterprise experiences in improving work–family reconciliation as well as a study to examine public opinion on childcare systems.

Mauritius The Ministry of Labour and Industrial Relations commissioned the University of Mauritius to conduct an assessment of the current situation of work–family conflict in the country, including surveys of employees and employers, as well as interviews with key informants.

United Kingdom The Work–Life Balance 2000 baseline study was conducted jointly by the Institute for Employment Research, University of Warwick and IFF Research. The study was commissioned by the Department for Education and Employment in order to provide baseline information for the Government's work–life balance campaign. The study provides representative information about the availability of work–life balance arrangements in British workplaces with five or more employees. It comprises three surveys: a survey of employers covering 2,500 workplaces, interviews with the head offices of 250 participating workplaces, and a survey of around 7,500 employees.

Source: ILO, 2000, for Chile; University of Mauritius, 2002, for Mauritius; Hogarth et al., 2001, for the United Kingdom.

#### b. Labour legislation and social security

With a view to creating effective equality of opportunity and treatment for men and women workers, all measures compatible with national conditions and possibilities shall be taken [...] to take account of their

needs in terms and conditions of employment and in social security.

(Convention No. 156, Article 4)

Ensuring basic minimal entitlements to decent working conditions in terms of working time, leave and family-related benefits for all workers through labour legislation and social security is usually considered the responsibility of the state. The alternative of leaving these issues entirely to employer initiatives or collective agreements necessarily leads to inequities. Two key areas of labour legislation influence the ability of workers to reconcile work with family responsibilities: leave entitlements (annual leave, sick leave, maternity leave and other forms of family leave) and working time provisions (including normal working time, overtime and part-time work). Various international labour standards exist in relation to leave and working time and provide the basis for national legislation.

The balance between law and collective bargaining varies depending on the industrial relations system in each country, as does the scope for improvement through collective bargaining. In some cases, legislation may be used as a means of generalizing practices to ensure that all workers benefit from provisions that exist in related collective bargaining agreements. Box 2 provides examples from Malaysia and the United Kingdom.

#### Box 2 Legislation generalizes benefits in collective agreements

Malaysia In 2000, maternity leave for workers in the private sector was extended from 45 to 60 days, following the minimum already established in collective agreements in the banking sector.

*United Kingdom* New legislation in 2003 provides rights to take parental leave and to request a reduction in working hours – rights which already existed in a number of workplaces and were more common in unionized than in non unionized ones.

Source: Jikunan, 2003, for Malaysia; Turner, 2003, for the United Kingdom.

A recent tendency is to enact legislation which gives workers more choice and flexibility and increases the scope for collective bargaining. In the case of maternity leave, for example, instead of specifying the number of weeks to be taken before and weeks of the leave must be taken after childbirth. Similarly, in the case of working time legislation, there has been a shift to legislation that allows some degree of local influence over working hours. The legislation embodies a rule or principle, sometimes with incentives, and leaves the social partners to determine the specific ways it will be applied. This allows for collective bargaining to adapt the principle to specific conditions and tends to enhance worker influence (McCann, 2004). Leaving room for flexibility means that local or sectoral circumstances can be taken into account and the resulting measures have more legitimacy.<sup>31</sup>

A major responsibility of government is to ensure that legislation is effectively implemented. Virtually everywhere, there are problems concerning the implementation of leave and working time provisions. From industrialized countries, for example, a large share of discrimination complaints received every year by administrative agencies in Hong Kong, the U.K. and the U.S. are related to maternity and family responsibilities.<sup>32</sup> In Canada a report on work-life conflict

<sup>31</sup> Dickens, L. (2000): "Collective bargaining and the promotion of gender equality at work: Opportunities and challenges for trade unions", in Transfer, Vol. 6, No. 2, pp. 197-208.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> E.g. see EOC, 2005. Greater Expectations: EOC's Investigation into Pregnancy Discrimination. http://83.137.212.42/sitearchive/eoc/PDF/suffer summary.pdf last accessed 09-2009; Lynch, K. (2003): Private conciliation of discrimination disputes: Confidentiality, informalism and power, enforcing equal opportunities in Hong Kong: An evaluation of conciliation and other enforcement powers of the EOC, The University of Hong Kong, Centre for comparative and public law, June 27-28, 2003, Publication No.84720 (Hong Kong); Williams, J. C. and E. S. Westfall (2006): "Deconstructing the maternal wall: Strategies for vindicating the civil rights of "carers" in the workplace", in Duke Journal of Gender Law and Policy, Volume 13: 31-53.

concludes that the Government could considerably help reconciliation by enforcing the implementation of existing legislation, in particular certain specific provisions related to overtime and leave entitlements.<sup>33</sup>

For governments in many developing and transition countries, the effective implementation of legislation is fraught with difficulties. Labour inspectorates may be understaffed, inspectors underpaid and means of transport very limited. Workers are often unaware of their rights or unwilling to claim them. Implementing basic legislation related to maternity (that women do not lose their jobs when pregnant and that they are able to take maternity leave) seems to be particularly difficult and reports of abuses in many countries abound.

In many countries, trade unions seek not only to improve legislation but to ensure the implementation of existing laws. When there are problems of enforcement of existing rights, duplicating them in collective agreements can be an important safeguard.<sup>34</sup> Thus in some developing countries, trade unions include maternity protection in collective bargaining agreements (see box 3), as already provided in labour legislation.

#### Box 3 Duplicating maternity protection legislation in collective agreements

In Brazil, an analysis of clauses in collective agreements established in 2000 found that the most frequent clause, found in 85 per cent of agreements, concerned job security for pregnant workers: a right already established by the law. The unions feel that this will help ensure that these provisions are applied and that, in case of infringement, they will be in a stronger position to defend the worker.

Source: Sorj, 2004.

In many countries, both industrialized and developing, social security plays a role in providing support for the costs of family care responsibilities. By paying contributions (alongside the employer) for health insurance, unemployment insurance, pension funds and so forth, workers and their families are insured against various risks related to health-care costs, disability, unemployment and loss of income in old age.

Payments received during maternity leave, paternity leave and parental leave usually come from some kind of social insurance (be it health insurance, a special fund or unemployment insurance) to which the employee must have contributed for a minimum time in order to benefit. However, this means that those who do not contribute, who are frequently in self-employment or under casual or precarious contracts, are excluded from these benefits.

The successive ILO Maternity Protection Conventions have specified that payment during maternity leave should come from social security or public funding. This helps to spread the costs of reproduction to all employers and employees who contribute to the fund and to society more generally.

Retirement or old-age pensions play an important role since they provide some autonomy to older people and help to relieve workers of some of the financial and care responsibility for ageing parents. This helps avoid the paradox of workers with family responsibilities taking extended leave or withdrawing for a time from employment in order to look after dependants and consequently ending up with shorter periods of contribution and reduced pensions themselves. In developing countries, many people, particularly the majority who work in the informal economy, are not covered by social security. They have little or no pension, and therefore are financially dependent on their children once they have no earnings.

## Leave policies

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Duxbury, L. and C. Higgins (2003): Work–life conflict in Canada in the new millennium: A status report (Ottawa, Health Canada, Population and Public Health Branch).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Olney, S., et al. (1998): Gender equality: A guide to collective bargaining (Geneva, ILO).

Leave entitlements enable workers to be temporarily absent to deal with caring responsibilities and family emergencies. Having leave at the same time as the rest of the family, particularly children, is important for the quality of family leave. Apart from maternity leave, key provisions for promoting a better share of care responsibilities between women and men include paternal leave, parental leave and emergency leave, which can be used for sick family members.

#### Paternity leave

Paternity leave is leave for the father around the time of birth of the baby. No international standard exists concerning paternity leave, but it is becoming increasingly common in national law and in enterprise practice. The growing frequency of this leave, particularly in collective bargaining agreements, may be an indicator of the increasing importance attached to the presence of the father around the time of childbirth and efforts to encourage men to share in family responsibilities. In some countries, collective bargaining has led to this entitlement becoming frequent and subsequently the government legislating so that all workers can benefit. Box 4 provides examples of enterprise provisions in two developing countries.

#### Box 4 Enterprise provisions for paternity leave

Malaysia The Banking Union in Malaysia has negotiated collective bargaining agreements in the banking sector which have included three days of paid paternity leave.

*Uganda* In Uganda there is no legal provision with regard to paternity leave. However, among the 82 organizations that responded to a mail survey of the Federation of Uganda Employers, 15 reported that they provided paternity leave which varied between one to four weeks.

Source: Jikunan, 2003, for Malaysia; Federation of Uganda Employers, 2002, for Uganda.

Paternity leave is usually short in duration and on full pay. The duration of paternity leave varies from one day in Saudi Arabia, to 18 days in Finland. As discussed above, in a number of countries there is no specific paternity leave but there is a more general short-term emergency leave or family leave which can be used by new fathers.

#### Parental leave

Either parent should have the possibility, within a period immediately following maternity leave, of obtaining leave of absence (parental leave), without relinquishing employment and with rights resulting from employment being safeguarded. [...] The length of the period following maternity leave and the duration and conditions of the leave of absence [...] should be determined in each country by [...] laws or regulations, collective agreements, works rules, arbitration awards, court decisions or a combination of these methods, or in any other manner consistent with national practice which may be appropriate, account being taken of national conditions.

(Recommendation on Workers with Family Responsibilities, 1981 (No. 165), Paragraphs 3 and 22)

Parental (or childcare) leave is a planned longer-term arrangement for care of young children and is different from maternity leave for mothers (in order to protect their health) or paternity leave for fathers around the time of the birth. As specified in Recommendation No. 165, either parent should be able to take parental leave.

In countries where the legislation provides for parental leave (which are mainly industrialized or transition countries), there is considerable variation concerning eligibility, payment, duration, possible flexibility in its use, the age of the child to be cared for and transferability between parents. The dispositions reflect the wider concerns within that society in relation to child development, fertility, labour supply, gender equity and income distribution.

In some countries, long parental leave may be seen as a way of supporting parental care of young children and reducing the need for childcare services, particularly for young children for whom services can be relatively expensive. In other countries, parental leave entitlements may be shorter to prevent long absences from the labour market and the resulting deterioration of skills.

**Scope**. In certain countries, parental leave is a family entitlement while in others it is an individual entitlement. When it is a family entitlement, dual-earner parents decide how much of the entitlement each will use and cannot take leave simultaneously. The EU Directive on Parental Leave stipulates that it should be available to both parents as an individual entitlement.<sup>35</sup>

The age of the child for which parental leave can be taken varies considerably, from under eight years in the EU Directive to a limit of the child's first birthday in Australia, Canada and New Zealand. Eligibility criteria for parental leave tend to be more restrictive than those for maternity leave. An interesting innovation in some countries, particularly in Central and Eastern Europe, is to widen the entitlement to parental leave to grandparents. This provides recognition of the key role that grandparents can often play in looking after grandchildren and facilitates such inter-generational support. The extent of use by a grandparent is not known.

**Duration**. The general trend is for the duration of parental leave entitlement to be relatively long, but payments are often low. Requirements stipulated in the related EU Directive are that the duration of parental leave should be a minimum of three months and workers must have the right to return to work to the same or a similar job. In most countries with parental leave, it is in fact much longer. Box 5 provides three examples of very diverse provisions as concerns duration.

#### Box 5 Some examples of parental leave provisions

*Estonia* Parental leave can be used by the mother or father in one part or in parts at any time and for any duration until the child is three years old. If the mother or father does not use their parental leave, the leave may be granted to the actual caregiver of the child (who must be a legal resident in Estonia). The cash benefit for the parental leave is paid by Social Security.

**Japan** Parental leave can be taken up to the child's first birthday. During the leave, parents receive 30 per cent of their previous earnings. An additional lump sum of 10 per cent is paid to them six months after their return to work

Latvia Every employee is eligible for parental leave of a maximum of one and a half years until the child reaches the age of eight years. The leave can be granted in one single period or in parts, but one month in advance the employee must notify the employer of the beginning and length of the leave. Payment comes from social security.

Source: ILO, Conditions of Work and Employment Database.

As with maternity and paternity leave, parental leave is a provision where collective bargaining agreements can improve on national legislation – either providing for it when there is no provision in national legislation or improving on the payment or duration. In many countries, parental leave is not provided by law, but is the result of CBAs or voluntary employer policy. Research in the U.K. shows that availability of this provision was more likely in companies with at least one active trade union.<sup>36</sup>

**Take-up rates by men and women**. A critical factor in take-up rates for both men and women is whether or not the leave is paid, and if so, to what extent. In practice, parental leave tends to be taken by the mother once maternity leave is finished, although small or no payments during leave limit the full use of parental leave entitlements. Take-up by

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> European Council (1996): "Council Directive 96/34/EC of 3 June 1996 on the framework agreement on parental leave concluded by UNICE, CEEP and the ETUC", in Official Journal, L145, 19 June (Luxembourg), pp. 4-9.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Budd, J.W. and K. Mumford (2004): "Trade unions and family-friendly policies in Britain", in Industrial and Labor Relations Review, Vol. 57, No. 2, pp.204-222

fathers is rare in most countries. For example, in Russia, men constituted only 0.6 per cent of workers taking childcare leave in 2001, for which an allowance is received from state social insurance.<sup>37</sup> The only countries with relatively high take-up by men are Iceland, Norway and Sweden, which provide for relatively high allowances during this period. Also to encourage fathers to take leave, some countries (Iceland, Denmark, Norway, Sweden, Austria) provide that some of the parental leave can only be taken by the father and is lost if he does not take it. Box 6 provides examples on how the Norwegian and Icelandic Governments have tried to encourage fathers to take parental leave with a certain amount of success.

#### Box 6 Encouraging fathers to take parental leave in France, Norway and Iceland

*France* In 2002, France introduced a paternity leave of 14 days, the first three fully paid by the employer and the remaining eleven paid by Social Security, up to 80 per cent of gross salary. The provision has shown remarkable success: almost two-thirds of eligible fathers had made use of this leave as of 2004. That includes wage-earners, the self-employed and farmers.

*Norway* In Norway, four weeks of the parental leave period are reserved for the father. These four weeks are not normally transferable to the mother and, if the father does not take them, they are lost. This rule was introduced in April 1993, based on a wish to encourage more fathers to take an active part in the care of the child during its first year. Fathers have had the possibility since as far back as 1977 of sharing the parental leave period with the mother. Few fathers exercised this option: only

2–3 per cent of fathers took parental leave at the beginning of the 1990s. The introduction of the paternity quota in 1993 led to a steep increase in the number of fathers taking their four-week leave. In 2001, about 85 per cent of the fathers who were entitled to the paternity quota made use of this right.

*Iceland* In Iceland, there has been a shift from a six-month period of parental leave at a flat rate (with predominantly female take-up) to a model with an independent, non-transferable father quota. Today the length of the parental leave is nine months divided into thirds, with three months for the mother, three months for the father, and another three months that the parents can share. The reimbursement is 80 per cent of the salary. The reform was implemented in three steps with one month reserved for the father in 2001, two months in 2002 and three months in 2003. From 2001 to October 2003 the average number of days taken by men increased from 39 to 83, and 13 per cent of the Icelandic fathers actually used more than their non-transferable part.

Source: DREES, 2005, for France; The Royal Ministry of Children and Family Affairs, 2003, for Norway; Einarsdóttir and Pétursdóttir, 2004, for Iceland.

Studies investigating the low take-up by men suggest the importance of employer attitudes: fathers may want to avoid being seen as uncommitted to their job and the consequences this might have for their careers. Men's low take-up can also be linked to the persisting female caring role, with the continuing expectation that women should take the main responsibility for family care.

**Maintaining social security benefits.** A major issue related to periods of parental leave is the continuation of health insurance and the inclusion of these periods in the calculation of pension benefits. In some countries, the person taking the parental leave will have a shorter time period for the calculation of pension at retirement. In other countries (such as Germany, Norway, Sweden and Switzerland), provisions have been introduced so that persons staying at home to look after young children are awarded pension credits for the period in question as if they had been employed and paying social security contributions.<sup>38</sup> In the Netherlands, most collective agreements provide for pension payments during parental leave.<sup>39</sup>

**Avoiding the leave trap**. According to the OECD, "Leave for long periods damages the future earnings prospects of mothers. If only for that reason, paid leave can only cover a

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Chetvernina, T., et al. (2003): Work and family: Russian Federation, Background Paper, Conditions of Work and Employment Programme, (Geneva, ILO).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> ILO (2001): Social security: Issues, challenges and prospects, Report VI, International Labour Conference, 89th Session, 2001, (Geneva, ILO).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> Income Data Services (IDS) (2001): "Balancing work and family life the Dutch way", in Employment Europe, No. 477, pp. 20-21.

short period of child rearing".<sup>40</sup> The Annual Report for Equal Opportunities for Men and Women in the European Union also expresses reservations about expanding leave arrangements: "While this is a positive development, given the gender imbalance in the approach to caring, with the responsibility continuing to fall on women, there is a danger that long periods of leave could have a negative impact on women's labour force participation, widen gender pay differentials and increase gender segregation."<sup>41</sup>

Research indicates that extended periods of leave have the effect of reducing future prospects for earnings and career development, particularly when the leave extends over a number of years. The German experience suggests that when women take very long periods of parental leave (three years), it becomes difficult for them to return to work, even when employers are required to reinstate them. As

Studies on worker preferences also indicate a preference for better paid leave during shorter periods rather than extended periods with little compensation. Denmark has changed its provisions for parental and childcare leave so that it becomes less possible to spend an extended period outside the labour force and reduces the chances of falling into a "leave trap". The possibility of taking parental leave on a part-time basis and returning to work part-time, can facilitate contact with the job and help avoid problems of reintegration.

#### Carer's leave

It should be possible for a worker with family responsibilities to obtain leave of absence in the case of the illness of another member of the worker's immediate family who needs that worker's care or support.

(Workers with Family Responsibilities Recommendation, 1981 (No. 165), Paragraph 23(2))

Family crises such as accidents or serious illnesses of dependents, such as HIV-related diseases may mean that workers need to take a more prolonged period of time off. On humanitarian grounds, managers may sometimes allow workers to take unpaid leave in such circumstances. However, increasingly governments are foreseeing an entitlement to a short or longer term leave which can be used for caring for family members who are ill, sometimes called carer's leave. In some cases, one type of leave serves for diverse family caring responsibilities, such as in Japan or the FMLA in the United States (see box 7) whereas in others specific types of leave are foreseen, such as the palliative leave in the Netherlands.

## Box 7 Carer's leave provisions

*Japan* In Japan, family care leave has been available since 1999 under the Child Care and Family Care Leave Act. Family care leave can be taken for the purpose of looking after a spouse, child, parent, or parent-in-law who is in need of constant care due to illness, such as an injury, sickness or physical or mental disability. The period of leave is limited to a maximum of three months and, in general, can only be taken once for each family member. This leave is unpaid but the employee gets 25 per cent of their wage reimbursed from employment insurance.

Netherlands Palliative leave in the Netherlands is leave of one to six months for care of a terminally-ill relative which is paid via the unemployment benefits system.

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> OECD (2002): Babies and bosses: Reconciling work and family life: Vol. 1, Australia, Denmark and the Netherlands (Paris, OECD), p.141.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> Commission of the European Communities (CEC) (2002): Annual report on equal opportunities for men and women in the European Union 2002, (Brussels), p.9.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> See for example, Anderson, D.J. et al. (2002): "The motherhood wage penalty: Which mothers pay it and why?", in American Economic Review, Vol. 92, No. 2, pp. 354-357; Ondrich, J., et al. (2002): The effect of maternity leave on women's pay in Germany, 1984-1994, Discussion Paper No. 289 (Berlin, German Institute for Economic Research).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> OECD (2003a): "Towards more and better jobs", OECD Employment Outlook 2003, (Paris, OECD).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> OECD, 2002, op.cit.

**Sweden** Leave to take care of a close family member can be taken under Social Insurance regulations in Sweden that provide reimbursement for a maximum of 60 days. If the care receiver is infected with the HIV virus, the maximum period of leave with reimbursement is 240 days.

*United States* The 12 weeks of unpaid leave available under the Family and Medical Leave Act of 1993 can be taken for specific family or medical reasons including: the birth of a child; care for a newborn or newly-adopted child; care for a child, spouse or parent who has a serious health condition; or a serious health condition of the employee.

Sources: Sato, 2000, for Japan; IDS, 2001, for the Netherlands; Leave Compensation and Leave for Care of Relatives Act, Section 4–6 (1988:1465), for Sweden; http://www.dol.gov/elaws/esa/fmla/vr.asp, for the United States.

#### **Short emergency leave**

Diverse types of provisions exist to provide for short emergency leave, some with wide definitions of emergency and others for specific events (such as bereavement) or particular family responsibilities, usually parenting. Sometimes provisions exist in national legislation, while more commonly they are in collective bargaining agreements or enterprise policy. Indeed, even in the absence of official policies, managers may try to accommodate those with serious problems that need a short absence.

To cope with AIDS-related emergencies, short leave measures result in a fundamental support for family care providers. Compassionate leave to prepare and attend funeral ceremonies is also important as the example from Uganda shows (box 8)

#### Box 8 Compassionate leave in Uganda

Civil Aviation Authority (CAA) The CAA provides 14 days of paid leave, referred to as compassionate leave, which is included in the collective bargaining agreement with workers. Compassionate leave can be added to maternity leave, paternity leave for new fathers, or it can be used to care for an ill family member, or for the funeral arrangements for a family member.

Kakira Sugar Works As part of its collective bargaining agreement, Kakira provides compassionate leave. This leave is handled on an individual basis between the manager and worker. A worker can receive a maximum of 14 days leave per year for bereavement due to death in the family, illness of family or for customary obligations (such as weddings).

Source: Gidongo, 2003, for the CAA; Thenge, 2003, for Kakira.

For family emergencies, rather than taking annual leave (or taking leave without pay), an understandable tendency has been for employees to call in sick. Increasingly companies are accepting that some sick leave can be used officially for such emergencies or for planned events such as meetings with teachers or administrative formalities. While by definition emergencies cannot be anticipated, some events are known in advance and it is easier for management to cope with the disruption if the employee provides advance warning rather than 'calling in sick' in the morning.

In Australian collective agreements, family or carer's leave is the most common family-friendly provision covering about half the relevant employees. <sup>45</sup> These agreements sometimes permit carers to use up some of their annual quota of sick days. Other agreements in Australia provide workers with days off to look after sick family in addition to the worker's own allocation of sick days.

In the Netherlands, short-term leave for caring or family emergencies has been the subject of legislation. In some cases, entitlements are only for parents with respect to their children. The European Directive on parental leave includes provision for time off from work on the grounds of *force majeure* for urgent family reasons in cases of sickness or accident making the immediate presence of the worker indispensable. <sup>46</sup> In some Central and Eastern European countries, parents have the statutory right to additional annual leave, as in the cases of Estonia and Poland given in box 9.

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> OECD, 2002, op.cit.

<sup>46</sup> European Council, 1996, op.cit.

#### Box 9 Childcare leave for parents

Estonia Parents are eligible for paid childcare leave every working year. The length of the leave is dependent on the number and age of the children:

- Three days for one or two children under 14 years old;
- Six days for three or more children under 14 years old or at least one child under the age of three.

*Poland* An employee who is bringing up at least one child under 14 years old shall have the right to two days of paid leave during the year.

Source: ILO, Conditions of Work and Employment Database.

In a number of countries, there are more general provisions for emergency leave which can be taken for family responsibilities. In some countries there is no specific provision for paternity leave, but there are more general types of leave which can be used by new fathers. Box 10 provides examples from Madagascar and the Seychelles of national legislation related to short-term leave.

#### Box 10 General provisions for short leave

**Madagascar** The Labour Code provides for up to ten unpaid days per year for family events (such as the marriage, birth or circumcision of a close relative).

Seychelles A worker is entitled to up to four days of paid leave for compassionate reasons such as the death of a close relative. In addition, the worker must be allowed reasonable time off work, with or without pay at the discretion of the employer, to attend matters which cannot normally be attended to except during the workers' working hours

Source: ILO, Conditions of Work and Employment Database.

#### Working time measures

Working time measures can help make the workplace more responsive to the needs of workers with family responsibilities, while also increasing productivity and expanding equal opportunity. Policies can include flexible work hours, such as staggered hours and flexitime, shorter working hours, compressed work weeks, work-sharing and job-sharing and individualized working hours. Such measures require careful design and implementation with consultation between the social partners and government, and with considerations to the predictability of working hours, the needs of workers with family responsibilities vis-à-vis school hours and care services, and parity across different categories of workers, e.g. full-time and part-time, in terms of employment and working conditions including social security, employment security, training opportunities, and so on.

#### Addressing long working hours

Particular attention should be given to general measures for improving working conditions and the quality of working life, including measures aiming at [...] the progressive reduction of daily hours of work and the reduction of overtime.

(Workers with Family Responsibilities Recommendation, 1981 (No. 165), Paragraph 18).

In some countries where long working hours are the norm, such as Japan, the government has taken action to reduce legal working hours. Developing countries have also been reducing the standard weekly hours of work. Examples of legislation are given in box 11.

#### Box 11. Legislation to reduce standard working hours

*Chile* The Chilean Labour Code of 2001 reduced standard hours of work from 48 to 45 beginning in 2005. *China* Legal hours of work were reduced from 48 hours per week to 44 in 1994 and then further reduced to 40 hours per week in 1995.

Japan Mainly to improve the quality of working life and discourage the culture of long hours which has long existed in Japan, the Government has gradually reduced legal normal hours to reach 40 hours per week in the late 1990s. There is some evidence that this legislation has reduced the proportion of workers working long hours. However, the effect has been small compared to that in Portugal (see below), suggesting the persistence of a long-hours culture in Japanese firms.

**Republic of Korea** The revised Labour Standards Act in 2003 reduced standard hours from 44 to 40 per week. It is being progressively implemented from 2004 to 2011 based on the size of firm.

**Portugal** Statutory normal weekly hours were reduced from 44 hours to 40 hours in 1996. The legislation seems to have considerably reduced the proportion working more than 40 hours per week. Source: ILO, 1995, for China; ILO, Conditions of Work and Employment Programme, 2004a, for Chile and Korea; Lee, 2004, for Japan and

rtugal

Legal reductions do not necessarily mean actual reductions in working hours. Many governments have insufficient means to ensure implementation of legislation with respect to working time limits and regulations concerning overtime. Even in Canada, where regulatory mechanisms are in place, implementation of existing legislation on overtime is one of the measures suggested by a recent report on work–life conflict.<sup>47</sup>

Although longer working hours and overtime may help enterprises respond to various types of emergencies, the productivity of workers who are tired after an eight-hour day may not provide the best solution – especially if such emergencies are frequent and predictable.

Working long hours, particularly when coupled with sleep disruption, causes deterioration of task performance, as it has detrimental effects on rates of error, pace of work and social behaviour. By contrast, there is some evidence that reductions in long hours might be a factor associated with increases in productivity. However, it is difficult to isolate the impact of reducing working hours per se, since reductions typically coincide with other changes, such as in work organization or new capital investment. As

When overtime is required, advance notice is important to all workers. This is particularly the case for those with family responsibilities so that they can make care arrangements. In developing countries, where it may be difficult for workers to contact their families from the workplace and families may worry about their safety when the worker does not come home as anticipated, this is all the more critical.

Recognizing the importance of this issue, some national legislation, collective agreements or company policies include provisions that require that a worker be notified in advance of overtime work. In Mauritius, for example, where there is compulsory overtime of 10 hours per week for workers in the Export Processing Zone, legislation provides that workers must be given at least 24-hours notice of overtime.<sup>50</sup>

#### Addressing the problems of asocial hours

Whenever practicable and appropriate, the special needs of workers, including those arising from family responsibilities, should be taken into account in shift-work arrangements and assignments to night work.

(Workers with Family Responsibilities Recommendation, 1981 (No. 165), Paragraph 19)

A first obvious problem for workers on asocial hours is finding time when they can see their children, particularly those who are in school. As with overtime, predictability of shifts and knowing the schedule well in advance is a vital factor for shift workers. When working hours fluctuate and are unpredictable, organizing daily or weekly routines is very difficult and stressful.

<sup>48</sup> Kodz, J. et al. (2002): Work–life balance: Beyond the rhetoric, IES Report No. 384 (Brighton, Institute for Employment Studies).

<sup>49</sup> Kodz, J. et al. (2003): Working long hours: A review of the evidence, Vol. 1 – Main report, DTI Employment Relations Research Series, ERRS16 (London, DTI).

<sup>50</sup> University of Mauritius (2002): Work and the family, Centre for Applied Social Research, (Réduit, University of Mauritius Press).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> Duxbury and Higgins, 2003, op.cit.

One of the main ways that shifts can be organized to help workers with family responsibilities is to ensure that workers on fixed permanent or rotating shifts can exchange or swap shifts based on need. So long as there are no pressing business reasons to prevent this, managers in many enterprises that use shift work generally do not object. For shift swapping to work effectively, it needs to be introduced into the enterprise through dialogue between workers and managers so that both parties clearly understand the rules.

Childcare can be a major problem for shift or night workers with children, both for preschoolers and children in school. In the United States, some of the first employers to get involved in childcare were hospitals where personnel work on shifts around the clock.

#### Box 12 Shift swapping in a collective bargaining agreement

In the agreement between the union Teamsters Local 445 and St. Luke's Hospital in Newburgh, New York in the **U.S.A.**, the union negotiated with the hospital to allow employees to switch workdays with other employees, provided that employer approval was obtained. Source: AFL-CIO, 2001.

## Improving the quality of part-time work

- (1) With a view to protecting part-time workers, temporary workers and homeworkers, many of whom have family responsibilities, the terms and conditions on which these types of employment are performed should be adequately regulated and supervised.
- (2) The terms and conditions of employment, including social security coverage, of parttime workers and temporary workers should be, to the extent possible, equivalent to those of full-time and permanent workers respectively; in appropriate cases their entitlement may be calculated on a pro rata basis.

(Workers with Family Responsibilities Recommendation, 1981 (No. 165), Paragraph 21)

Improving working conditions and employment protection for part-time workers is not a particularly new idea. The approach emerged in European countries, where the Dutch approach has been particularly influential. The Netherlands introduced the earliest equality measures, removing the minimum hours thresholds to the statutory minimum wage and holiday pay and to social security legislation, ensuring these rights were available to all employees irrespective of their working hours.<sup>51</sup>

Reflecting a growing concern about the conditions of part-time workers, the ILO adopted in 1994 the Part-Time Work Convention, 1994 (No. 175), which specially refers to workers with family responsibilities, summarized in box 13.

#### Box 13 Part-time Work Convention, 1994 (No. 175)

The Part-Time Work Convention, 1994 (No. 175), promotes measures to ensure that part-time workers receive the same protection as comparable full-time workers and receive equivalent conditions, particularly regarding:

- occupational safety and health;
- preventing discrimination in employment and occupation;
- basic hourly wages;
- access to statutory social security schemes;
- maternity leave, termination of employment, paid annual leave, and paid public holidays and sick leave.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> McCann, D. (2004): "Working time needs and preferences", in J.C. Messenger (ed.): Working time and workers' preferences in industrialized countries: Finding the balance, pp. 10-28 (London, Routledge).

With the adoption in 1997 of the European Directive on Part-time Work<sup>52</sup>, which provides for regulatory measures for equitable treatment of part-time workers and the prevention of discrimination, the move towards legislated improvements in part-time work gained momentum, at least in Europe.

At the national level, the most extensive protection is offered by legislation which demands equality in all spheres where part-timers could be differentially treated, including basic wages and other forms of work-related income such as overtime, shift work and unsocial hours premiums and access to vocational training and promotion.<sup>53</sup> Some countries have also adopted legislative provisions to give "on call" workers a minimum of security in respect of the hours they work.<sup>54</sup>

At enterprise level, there have been efforts to ensure the quality of part-time work both through management initiatives and collective bargaining agreements. Trade unions are recognizing the importance of quality part-time work and have negotiated related terms into their collective bargaining agreements.

#### Moving between full-time and part-time work

Part-time workers should be given the option to obtain or return to fulltime employment when a vacancy exists and when the circumstances which determined assignment to part-time employment no longer exist.

(Workers with Family Responsibilities Recommendation, 1981 (No.165), Paragraph 21(3))

Many of those who work part time, or who wish to work part time, want to do so for a specific period of their life, such as when their children are young (Fagan, 2003). The provision for workers to be able to move between full-time and part-time hours was already included in the Recommendation on Workers with Family Responsibilities, 1981, and is foreseen in the Part-Time Work Convention, 1994 (article 9). It is increasingly being incorporated in varying ways in national legislation.

A number of countries allow particular reductions in working time for carers. In some cases, it is specifically for parents. When parental leave exists, there may also be provisions for taking it part time as in Germany, Finland and Sweden. Other countries provide that parents with children under a certain age can reduce their working hours under certain circumstances. For example in the United Kingdom, parents with a child under six have the right to request flexible working, which could be reduced hours. The Netherlands is an exceptional case where legislation provides all workers with a more general right to change working hours and there is no requirement to have caring responsibilities

As workers take advantage of these opportunities, the types of jobs that are worked parttime are expected to become more variable and more highly skilled, thus reducing the segregation of part-time work. Such legislation also means that those workers (mainly women) who wish to work part time for a period can remain in their current jobs rather than changing to a part-time job where they may have lower wages and fewer career possibilities.

#### Flexibility of working time and location

\_\_\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> European Council (1998): "Council Directive 97/81/EC of 15 December 1997 concerning the Framework Agreement on part-time work concluded by UNICE, CEEP and the ETUC – Annex: Framework agreement on part-time work", in Official Journal, L 014, 20 January, p. 9-14, (Brussels).

<sup>53</sup> McCann, 2004, op.cit.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> ILO (1992): Part-time work, Report V(1), International Labour Conference, 80th Session, 1993, pp. 36–7, (Geneva, ILO).

Particular attention should be given to general measures for improving working conditions and the quality of work life, including measures aiming at [...] (b) more flexible arrangements as regards working schedules, rest periods and holidays, account being take of the stage of development and the particular needs of the country and of different sectors of activity.

(Workers with Family Responsibilities Recommendation, 1981 (No. 165), Paragraph 18)

The flexibilities sought by employers in order to cover extended opening hours or to deal with varying workloads and tight delivery schedules can be family-unfriendly (such as overtime without notice) and differ from the flexibilities sought by workers for coping with family responsibilities. The principal challenge is to find forms of work organization and working time that increase efficiency and productivity, while at the same time allowing staff to fulfil their work commitments and cope with their family responsibilities. The flexibility options discussed in this section will be those schedules that provide workers with some degree of choice over when they work their hours, making it easier to establish viable daily routines and cope with emergencies.

Although flexible schedules have become increasingly common in industrialized countries, in developing countries there seems, so far, to be little experimentation. Yet such schedules may have considerable potential for increasing productivity while helping workers better reconcile work with family responsibilities. The introduction of flexible arrangements for working hours may contribute to solving traffic as well as family problems and merits serious consideration in many congested urban areas.

#### **Flexitime**

By far the most frequent form of flexible working arrangement is flexitime. This arrangement requires employees to be present at their place of work for certain specified periods (called "core time") and allows them to vary their starting and finishing within certain limits. Flexitime arrangements present obvious advantages for workers with family responsibilities, who may adapt their starting and finishing times to school hours and, more generally, better adapt their working time to the schedules of other family members. However, all workers tend to appreciate flexitime schedules with the possibilities they offer to meet various needs or even just to avoid traffic problems. Managers have initiated flexitime arrangements in view of the benefits for their enterprises and the productivity and job satisfaction of their workforces.

#### Time banking

Time banking (or working time accounts) involves keeping track of hours worked in "accounts" for individual workers and in some cases is combined with flexitime. Time banking permits workers to build up credits or accumulate deficits in hours worked, up to a maximum amount. Periods involved generally range from several months to a year. The advantage of time banking for workers is that they can accumulate leave, although the degree of choice they have on when to take this is critical. For employers, time banking means they can increase hours in peak periods and avoid overtime payments. It is interesting that in Brazil, the "hours bank" is the most

popular flexible hours scheme for inclusion in collective bargaining agreements (see box 14).

#### **Box 14 Time banks in CBAs in Brazil**

Research conducted in 2002 by the Confederação Nacional da Indústria (National Confederation of Industry) in **Brazil** on collective agreements found that clauses for a time bank system were found in a number of agreements:

- 11 out of 17 agreements in the chemicals sector
- 10 out of 20 in the food industry
- 8 out of 20 in the metallurgy sector

Other flexible arrangements were insignificant.

Source: Sorj, B. (2004): Reconciling work and family: Issues and policies in Brazil, Conditions of Work and Employment Series No. 8 (Geneva, ILO).

#### **Telework**

Telework (or telecommuting) is a working arrangement in which employees can carry out their work responsibilities from a location other than the workplace of the employer, on a regular or on an emergency basis. Generally, where the technology is available, the use of telework is increasing. Employers who have introduced telework arrangements have noted beneficial results for the enterprise, in terms of cost-cuts and improved productivity.

While telework from home has obvious potential for work–family reconciliation, this is probably not the major factor accounting for the rapidly increasing numbers of such workers as it is more likely to be linked to self-employment. Nevertheless, teleworking can be a particularly useful form of work for employees with children as it allows them to breastfeed, take care of a sick child, or monitor young children who may have school holidays.

In spite of the advantages of telework from home, it is not without its problems. Clearly the bulk of employment found in most countries is not suited for telework and, in most places, work will continue to be done in traditional forms for the foreseeable future (notably in many developing countries). There can also be disadvantages to telework from the workers' side: worker isolation, reduced job security and promotion opportunities, and diminished health and safety protection. Finally, some of the conspicuous advantages of teleworking for workers with family responsibilities, such as being able to care for young children, may in fact make it more difficult to be productive at home.

#### c. Measures encouraging care services

All measures compatible with national conditions and possibilities shall further be taken – (a) to take account of the needs of workers with family responsibilities in community planning; and

(b) to develop or promote community services, public or private, such as child-care and family services and facilities.

(Workers with Family Responsibilities Convention, 1981 (No. 156), Article 5)

Care facilities play a key role in helping reconcile work and family. This section looks briefly at strategic approaches by governments for the financing of care services. The degree to which governments are involved in supporting care financially is highly variable. While imitating the Nordic models with high government provision is clearly beyond the resources of many states and certainly of developing countries, there are less costly ways in which governments can intervene to address strategically the provision of care services of acceptable standards.

In virtually all countries, there is a private sector of care facilities, particularly for children, including day care, crèches, childminders and nannies, responding to the demand for such facilities and financed entirely by families. Facilities for the elderly have not been as much in demand, although the situation is changing in countries with high life expectancy. Private facilities tend to be of variable quality, depending mainly on the family's ability to pay. Some

<sup>55</sup> Hotopp, U. (2002): "Teleworking in the UK", in Labour Market Trends, Vol. 11, No. 6, pp. 311-318.

governments have intervened with a view to controlling quality and ensuring minimum standards.

The most frequent facilities provided directly by some governments are preschools or kindergartens. These are often an extension of the primary school system to younger ages so that children receive social and cognitive preparation for school, the main objective being to provide for the educational needs of children and not the childcare needs of working parents. Pre-schools or kindergartens that are part of the public educational system are well established in many European countries, and a number of developing countries are trying to move in this direction.

For younger children under age three, public financing is rarer but found in some European countries, in particular the Nordic countries. Central governments usually do not run facilities themselves: for example in Norway and Sweden, government subsidies for childcare facilities are given to municipalities which are responsible for running them. For younger children, most countries rely mainly on commercial private sector provision. "Part of the reason for the lower provision of formal childcare for the under-threes is the greater costs involved in caring for very young children". Also, there may be less need for formal childcare provision for very young children since families may favour care by the mother, facilitated by longer maternity leave and parental leave (the latter typically available for either the father or the mother).

As concerns childcare, and to a lesser extent elderly care, governments have attempted to reconcile considerations of quantity, quality and cost by encouraging the private sector, NGOs at the community level, religious institutions and private entities, as well as unions and employers, to become active providers. This policy, as well as being less costly for the state, can bring services more in line with the precise needs of the workers concerned.

In Japan, for example, a new market-oriented approach was adopted in the late 1990s which allowed private provision of licensed day care in order to offer greater choice and more flexible services to consumers. Commercial centres can receive substantial local government subsidies, provided they comply with the standards set by each local government and charge parents no more than the prescribed maximum.<sup>57</sup> The example of pre-school childcare in Brazil (box 15) demonstrates the variety of arrangements and resources that can be used to finance childcare facilities.

#### Box 15 Public-private and employer mix of day care in Brazil

The 1988 Constitution of **Brazil** guarantees pre-school care for all children below the age of six. In 1996, the National Education Guidelines Law included infant education within the school system. By 1998, over a quarter of children in the relevant age group attended pre-school. The varied supply of pre-schools prevents any simple distinction between private or public, market or state responsibility. A more adequate classification refers to the method of financing:

- public pre-schools, entirely under the financial control and direct management of the public authority;
- philanthropic pre-schools, run by religious or philanthropic institutions;
- employer pre-schools, provided by firms for their employees in fulfilment of labour legislation;
- community pre-schools, emerging from associations of informal groups which receive support from NGOs and from public authorities;
- $-\ private\ pre-schools\ supplied\ by\ the\ market,\ whose\ services\ are\ designed\ and\ paid\ for\ by\ higher-income\ families.$

With responsibility for pre-school care, municipalities have the option of concluding varied agreements with society-based initiatives, and most institutions combine various types of financing simultaneously. Non-government bodies (community organizations, NGOs and philanthropic institutions) have now become the principal instruments for implementing childcare. They are considered less corrupt, administratively more streamlined and better informed about the real needs of the population.

Source: Sorj, B. (2001): "Child care as public policy in Brazil", in M. Daly (ed.): Care work: The quest for security, pp. 105-124 (Geneva, ILO).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> OECD (2001): OECD Employment Outlook 2001, p. 144, (Paris, OECD).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup> OECD (2003b): Babies and bosses: Reconciling work and family life: Vol. 2, Austria, Ireland and Japan (Paris, OECD).

Likewise the example of Kenya (box 16) illustrates the use of partnerships for the provision of pre-school care.

#### Box 16 Civil society involvement in Kenya

Primary schools in **Kenya** are required to have a unit for pre-school education for children from the age of three, known as Baby Classes, where parents can leave their children in the morning and pick them up on the way home from work. The Government has adopted a policy of partnership which allows parents' associations, religious and welfare organizations, private firms and individuals to cooperate with local authorities for the creation, financing and management of these units. These partners have also played a key role in training pre-school teachers.

Source: Karega, (2002): Work and family study in Kenya: Implications of combining work and family responsibilities, Unpublished Working Paper, Conditions of Work and Employment Programme, (Geneva, ILO,).

Some governments try to make childcare more affordable for parents by providing subsidies to care providers or income-based allowances to parents. In most countries where formal childcare has developed, public subsidies cover part of the cost, in varying degrees. In the United States, parental fees constitute 76 per cent of childcare financing and low-income families devote about 25 per cent of their family income to childcare. By contrast, in Japan, parents' share of total costs is under 30 per cent and the average fees paid by parents amount to about 8 per cent of average earnings. Per cent of average earnings.

Government subsidies for care facilities have in some cases been utilized by trade unions, who have established facilities themselves as a way of broadening the services they provide for members and workers. Singaporean trade unions, for example, are renowned for the facilities they provide, which go well beyond childcare (see box 17).

#### Box 17 Family care programmes by Singapore trade unions

In 1969, the Government of **Singapore** encouraged the labour movement to redefine its role from one narrowly focused on collective bargaining and grievance handling to helping workers in all aspects of their life. It was thus that the National Trades Union Congress (NTUC), composed of 63 unions, set up a series of cooperatives related to family care including an Elder Care cooperative. Most of these are open to all workers, regardless of whether they are union members or not, but union members have an additional discount over and above the government subsidies. NTUC has become the largest single provider of quality and affordable childcare in Singapore. Currently it has 39 centres, with a total intake of over 3,000 children. NTUC Childcare is a leading training agency in early childhood care and education, providing a range of training courses and workshops for childcare professionals. It also offers consultancy on workplace childcare, customized training and projects in early childhood development and education. Source: NTUC Childcare web site: www.ntuc-childcare.com

Fees linked to parents' income can be a way of making childcare facilities more affordable. In both Austria and France, for example, fees are determined in relation to the income of the parents, and fee subsidies are paid directly by the state to the provider. Similarly, in Australia there has been a move away from direct subsidies to providers to funding for reducing the fees paid by parents. Allowances or vouchers to low-income parents to help pay the costs of care are another way of providing support. Box 18 provides some examples of allowances which target low-income families.

## Box 18 Targeted allowances for care

*France* The Free Choice of Child Care Supplement of PAJE (*Prestation d'Accueil du Jeune Enfant*), the new unified childcare benefit, grants a means-tested allowance to parents placing a child under six with a registered childminder. To be registered, the childminder must follow 60 hours of training. The social insurance contributions for employing the childminder are paid by the state and not the parents.

*United Kingdom* Government measures announced in 2003 include direct financial support to lower- and middle-income working parents for the cost of approved childcare.

Source: Klammer and Letablier, 2007, for France; HM Treasury and DTI, 2003, for the United Kingdom.

One disadvantage of relating subsidies to family income is that they can represent a highly regressive tax on the earnings of a family member (usually the woman) who is considering whether to work or not, if, as is usually the case, total family earnings are tested. In developing

<sup>59</sup> OECD, 2003b, op.cit.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> OECD, 2001, op.cit.

countries with more limited government resources, there has been a tendency to concentrate initiatives on populations and geographical areas where need is perceived to be greatest. For example, in Guatemala, the government programme of Community Daycare Centres ("Hogares Comunitarios") targets particularly destitute communities in the city.<sup>60</sup>

In South Africa, the government is implementing a non-conditional cash benefit programme, the Child Support Grant, in the form of child allowances paid to the caregiver, instead of the mother. The merit of this "follow the child" approach would be to avoid the reinforcement of the role of women as primary caregivers. In addition, the grant is not conditional on the mother having to attend training sessions or performing unpaid community work, a controversial feature of family and child allowances in other developing countries. In May 2006 the size of the grant stood at USD 25.50 per under-fourteen child per month. The total beneficiaries summed up to almost 7 million children<sup>61</sup>.

Employment guarantee schemes have increasingly been perceived as an effective tool integrating employment and social protection objectives. If properly structured, these public work schemes may bring potentialities for reducing unpaid care work, including HIV/AIDS-related care burdens. While examples of public healthworks programmes are not yet registered, in some countries, such as South Africa and India (see box 19), labour-intensive programmes have included reduction of unpaid care work among their objectives. For instance, the Expanded Public Works Programme (EPWP) of South Africa provides childcare as one of the essential social services to foster employment and reduce poverty. The scheme is designed in such a way to ensure that women can participate as EPWP workers, while not ending up working even longer hours in combined paid and unpaid work<sup>62</sup>.

#### **Box 19 India's National Rural Employment Guarantee Programme (NRAGA)**

The National Rural Employment Guarantee Programme (NRAGA), launched by the Government of **India** in 2005, also recognizes the implications that family responsibilities carry vis-à-vis women's ability to freely engage in paid economic activities. Section 5.6 of the NRAGA's Operational Guidelines (2006) includes crèches among other worksite facilities, such as medical aid, drinking water and shade, that the local implementing agency has the responsibility to set out in order ensure the effective implementation of the employment-generating programme.

As seen earlier, domestic work constitutes a work-family reconciliation strategy for many households in the absence of adequate public supports. But domestic work often means work that is undervalued and of poor quality. Any public policy aimed at improving the quality and coverage of support services to working families should also look into and address the specific plight of domestic workers.

#### d. Lightening the burden

The competent authorities and bodies in each country should promote such public and private action as is possible to lighten the burden deriving from the family responsibilities of workers. (Recommendation No. 165, Paragraph 32)

In their role as providers of essential services, governments can do a lot to alleviate the burden of family responsibilities. There are many ways to go about this: sometimes, innovative thinking can produce useful ideas which are not necessarily expensive. A major service provided by governments is schools, whose hours have a major impact on working parents. School hours are, in principle, designed for the wellbeing of the children but can sometimes be adapted to be more convenient for parents.

.

<sup>60</sup> International Food Policy Research Institute, 2003, op.cit.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>61</sup> Razavi, S. (2007): The political and social economy or care in a development context: Conceptual issues, research questions and policy options, UNRISD Programme on Gender and Development, Paper No. 3, (Geneva UNRISD).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>62</sup> Antonopulos, R. (2007): The right to a job, the right types of projects: Employment guarantee policies from a gender perspective, The Levy Economics Institute of Bard College, Working Paper No. 516, p.19.

The opening hours of other government services (such as postal services, processing of birth certificates and drivers' licenses) can also exacerbate work–family conflicts when these services are open mainly during conventional working hours.

With more flexible approaches to working schedules, it might be possible to extend the opening hours of these services and perhaps, at the same time, provide government workers themselves with more choice concerning their working time.

In some countries, government services (such as medical visits, vaccinating a child, paying bills) can involve long queues or trips where workers can waste many hours, sometimes losing pay because of their absence from work. For instance, research carried out at the public health facilities of Lilongwe (Malawi) in 2000 found that on average individuals spent USD 13 (which equates to18 days income) and lost an additional USD 16 from 22 lost working days in obtaining a diagnosis for tuberculosis. <sup>63</sup>. Finding ways of better organizing these services to avoid long waits would already go some way to reducing the conflict between economic needs and unpaid care needs.

Other services which affect the burden of family tasks and may be indirectly influenced by governments are banking hours, store opening hours and medical appointments. Regulations concerning the timing of store opening hours can be quite controversial, since extending hours may be helpful for employed consumers but may mean associal or long hours for store workers.

As previously discussed, a factor exacerbating work–family conflict is the time and effort spent travelling between home, work and care services. The problem of long and tiring trips to work can be partially addressed by transport policy and spatial planning – issues that are rarely considered in the context of work and family reconciliation. To help workers with transport problems, some large enterprises may organize transport facilities themselves, but this profits only a small minority of workers.

Decentralizing to "satellite" offices may also help reduce workers' travel times. Flexibility of working schedules is another way for workers to avoid traffic jams and peak hours. In addition, if measures related to working hours become more diffuse, they may have the overall effect of spreading the rush hour over a longer period thus reducing the congestion.

Spatial concentration of services in the community, both private and public, is another means of reducing transport problems. In the Netherlands, experiments on daily routine arrangements found that infrastructure, such as social welfare centres, primary schools or youth centres, was often under-utilized and that local authorities may be able to find ways of augmenting the use of such buildings while grouping services.<sup>64</sup>

Various technological advances are reducing the time required for domestic chores – from running water to electrical appliances. Services and products for reducing time spent in cooking are multiplying. The main problem is the cost, which may be too high for those with low incomes who need these facilities most. Governments could envisage measures to help alleviate household tasks and facilitate access to labour-saving technology. In Mauritius, for example, the Employees' Welfare Fund of the Export Processing Zone has made loans available to workers at concessionary rates to enable them to buy domestic appliances. 65

\_

<sup>63</sup> Kemp, J.R. and al. (2007): Can Malawi's poor afford free tuberculosis service? Patient and household costs associated with a tuberculosis diagnosis in Lilongwe, Bulletin of the World Health Organization, No.85, pp.580-585.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>64</sup> Netherlands, Ministry of Social Affairs and Employment (2002): Daily routine arrangements: Experiments in the Netherlands (The Hague).

<sup>65</sup> University of Mauritius, 2002, op.cit.

In many rural and peri-urban communities of developing countries, considerable time is spent (mainly by women) doing unremunerated household chores, such as collecting water and fuel. Reducing this time would be one of the benefits of providing utilities such as water and energy.

Providing access to services to reduce household work is another way of lightening the domestic burden. Such services (laundry, take-away meals) typically develop in the private sector once there is a demand.

In some countries with high levels of fertility, governments see lowering fertility as a way of creating family structures that are more easily reconcilable with work responsibilities<sup>66</sup>. When levels are high, reducing fertility through family planning and family welfare programmes is often an aim in itself. Lower fertility is expected to contribute to raising the educational levels of children while limiting the future growth of the labour force, which in some countries risks outstripping possibilities for employment creation. It is also felt to help work–family reconciliation since families with numerous and closely spaced children are likely to have difficulties coping with earning a living while caring for children.

#### e. Facilitating re-entry into the labour force

All measures compatible with national conditions and possibilities, including measures in the field of vocational guidance and training, shall be taken to enable workers with family responsibilities to become and remain integrated in the labour force, as well as to re-enter the labour force after an absence due to those responsibilities.

(Convention No. 156, Article 7)

The longer the absence from work, the more skills are likely to have deteriorated or need to be updated. When the absence is covered by a leave (typically maternity or parental leave), some employers make an effort to keep in touch with employees and provide them with training on return. When the person must find new employment, they are in a similar situation to the many unemployed who need measures to give them a second chance.

Many countries pursue active labour market policies in order to help people back into employment after they have dropped out of the labour force, or to help them return to work after periods of unemployment. These policies are essentially for ensuring that family responsibilities do not undermine men's and women's possibilities for paid work and to promote broader conditions for equality in both paid and unpaid work. Active labour market policies have a long tradition in countries such as Sweden, Denmark and Germany and are more or less systematically pursued today in all EU Member States.<sup>67</sup>

Evaluations suggest that active labour market measures are likely to be most effective in (re)integrating people into employment when they are part of a package of mutually supportive services that may include remedial education, job training, job search assistance and direct provision of work experience. Box 20 provides an example of such an approach in Switzerland, which is directed specifically at women wishing to rejoin the labour force.

#### Box 20 Support for women to return to work in Geneva, Switzerland

The careers advice and training office of the Canton of Geneva in **Switzerland** has a special programme "Femme et Emploi" (Women and Employment) which provides counselling and support for women who have been out of the labour market and wish to return to work. The programme helps women to assess their capacities, interests and constraints. Initiatives include additional training or internships in enterprises, as well as help with finding a job. Source: Official site of the Canton of Geneva, Office d'Orientation et de Formation Professionnelle <a href="http://www.geneve.ch/oofp.">http://www.geneve.ch/oofp.</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>66</sup> ILO (1993): Report of the Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendation, Report III (Part 4B), General Survey of the Reports on the Workers with Family Responsibilities Convention (No. 156) and Recommendation (No. 165), 1981, International Labour Conference, 80th Session, 1993 (Geneva, ILO).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>67</sup> ILO (2003): Time for equality at work: Global report under the follow-up to the ILO Declaration on Fundamental Principles at Work, (Geneva, ILO).

#### f. Communication and information

The competent authorities and bodies in each country shall take appropriate measures to promote information and education which engender broader public understanding of the principle of equality of opportunity and treatment for men and women workers and of the problems of workers with family responsibilities, as well as a climate of opinion conducive to overcoming these problems.

(Convention No. 156, Article 6)

The competent authorities and bodies in each country shall take appropriate measures:

- a. to undertake or promote such research as may be necessary into the various aspects of employment of workers with family responsibilities with a view to providing objective information on which sound policies and measures may be based; and
- b. to promote such education as will encourage the sharing of responsibilities between men and women and enable workers with family responsibilities better to meet their employment and family responsibilities.

(Workers with Family Responsibilities Recommendation, 1981 (No. 165), Paragraph 11).

Information and communication are functions where government can play a major role. Governments need to ensure that existing rights are known and they can set the tone for public debate on work–family issues. Various governments publish newsletters, pamphlets, manuals and other material to disseminate information on their work–family legislation and policies and to promote the policy debate. A number of government countries have extensive web sites giving information about legislation and worker rights and provide guidance both to working parents and employers.

Some governments have created units with specific responsibility for research and advocacy on work–family issues, have published various types of documents and led public awareness-raising campaigns to encourage understanding of the issue and promote a better sharing of family responsibilities among women and men. For instance, in 2004 the Women Secretary of Paraguay's government launched a three-year long global campaign to promote gender equality in all the dimensions of women's and men's life. Against the backdrop of Paraguay's poverty rate which is among the highest in Latin America and women's lower labour force participation rate (56.3%) compared to men's (85 %), the campaign, titled "Women and men, equal in all the realms" had extensive media coverage and aimed at changing historical cultural patters of discrimination at home as well as at work.

In addition, national leaders can provide powerful role models and promote behaviour that breaks away from traditional gender stereotypes. For example, when the wife of the Finnish Prime Minister, Paavo Lipponen, had a baby in March 2000, he took the two weeks of paternity leave which are available to Finnish fathers. His example was seen as a move to encourage others.

#### g. Promotion of social dialogue and tripartite participation

Governments and social partners can promote change and support measures at the workplace, emphasizing the importance of social dialogue and highlighting the roles of the social partners in the change process.

#### Government advocacy

A particular focus of government advocacy with the stakeholders in a number of countries (for example, Australia, Canada, Singapore and the United Kingdom) has been the encouragement of more work–family measures at the workplace. This approach has the merit of highlighting for employers the benefits of work–family measures, many of which depend on initiatives at the workplace and can complement basic minimum measures provided in national legislation and social policies.

Making the workplace and working conditions more family-friendly while ensuring the competitiveness of enterprises requires tripartite dialogue and collaboration. Dialogue on work–family issues can take place on an ad hoc basis or within various types of existing committees, but some governments have set up specific committees to try to ensure extensive and regular consultations with the social partners (box 21).

#### **Box 21 Tripartite committees**

Singapore The government Work–Life Unit works through the Tripartite Committee on Work–Life Strategy. The Committee aims to promote good work–life practices and facilitate the implementation of work–life strategies. It collaborates on the Singapore Family Friendly Employer Award, which is organized biennially. United Kingdom In January 2000, the Minister for Employment and Equal Opportunities set up a new Advisory Committee to provide expert advice on the development of the government campaign to promote a better work–home balance for employees. It brought together key partners from business, trades unions and the voluntary sector. One of the objectives was "to unify the interests of employers and employees – so that employers improve their profitability and productivity and employees achieve a better balance between work and home life for employees".

Sources: http://www.mcds.gov.sg, for Singapore; DTI, 2000, for the United Kingdom.

A somewhat different approach was taken in Ireland, where government and the social partners set up a tripartite committee that has responsibility for overseeing the promotion of work–life balance policies at enterprise level. In this way, the implementing institution itself is tripartite and its composition includes the social partners as well as a number of key government ministries. The Committee has a web site and works with the employers' and workers' organizations on various publications and other activities to facilitate practices for work–life balance.

#### Employer advocacy

In some cases, employers have created promotional alliances, helping to convince other employers of the benefits of work—life policies, often in cooperation with government. This is the case, for example, of the Employer Alliance on Work and Family in Singapore that comprises companies that have won the Family Friendly Employer Award. Activities of the Alliance include promotional talks to share good practices, hosting company visits and supporting a mobile exposition of family friendly practices.

The Irish Business and Employers' Confederation (IBEC) has also taken a number of initiatives to promote family-friendly, work-life balance among its members, including management training, research and publications on measures to promote work-life balance.

#### Trade union advocacy

In order to promote the well-being of workers and improve work-family reconciliation, trade unions have been active in advocating improvements in national legislation and policies, supporting the collective bargaining processes and informing workers of their rights. To promote the family-friendly workplace, trade unions have also been working to increase the number of work-family provisions in collective bargaining agreements. A number of trade unions have produced information materials or toolkits to assist negotiators. Box 22 provides examples of materials produced by unions in Australia

(ACTU), Ireland (ITUC), the United Kingdom (TUC) and the United States (AFL-CIO) which could be of interest to readers in other countries.

#### Box 22 Trade union federations produce resource kits

**Australia** As part of its Work and Family Campaign, ACTU has developed a resource kit that is designed to assist delegates and organizers to recruit new members or encourage activist involvement in bargaining for improved family rights at work. The kit can be used as a tool to assess the work–family needs of members and provides fact sheets, surveys and suggestions for workplace activities.

*Ireland* In order to prepare its guide, *Family Friendly Working and Work Life Balance Guidelines*, the ITUC first held a series of regional seminars for trade union officials and representatives as well as focus groups to find out what the trade unions needed to assist them to move the family-friendly, work–life balance agenda forward. The main stumbling blocks found for employers and trade unions were a lack of information on the options available and no clear method for beginning a process of developing family-friendly, work–life balance policies and arrangements.

*United Kingdom* The TUC is starting an online course on work–life balance for union representatives based on its publication *Changing times: A TUC guide to work–life balance*. In addition, it publishes a free fortnightly bulletin on work–life balance issues which is available on its web site.

*United States* On its web site, the AFL-CIO provides bargaining fact sheets on issues such as control over work hours, comprehensive advice on forms of family leave, as well as possible questions for a questionnaire which affiliates could use to better identify the work and family needs of workers.

Sources: http://actu.asn.au; http://www.ictu.ie; http://www.tuc.org.uk; http://www.aflcio.org

National trade union organizations can also disseminate information on profamily legislation. Workers cannot exercise rights that they do not know about. Various means can be used to reach workers with this information, such as newsletters, information kits, study circles and training of shop stewards. In the industrialized countries, the Web is providing new possibilities for reaching workers and their representatives.

Even when pro-family legislation exists, vigorous action is often necessary to ensure not only that workers know their rights but also that they are able to exercise them. The ITUC maintains that "every day women are let go or discriminated against in the workplace for pregnancy-related reasons". It has launched a campaign "Decent work, decent life", among others, to inform women of the maternity protection under existing legislation, encouraging them to join the union to help them protect their rights.

# 5. Conclusion: Work-family measures and the objective of gender equality

As noted in the introduction, the Workers with Family Responsibilities Convention, 1981 (No. 156), replaced a previous Recommendation on Women with Family Responsibility, which had been adopted in 1965. The 1981 Convention not only concerns both men and women but also specifies that work–family reconciliation measures should be undertaken "with a view to creating effective equality of opportunity and treatment for men and women workers".

Periodically the ILO requests governments to report on their law and practice with respect to Convention No. 156. Following the review of the last ILO General Survey among countries which ratified C.156, the Committee of Experts concluded that "relatively few governments have yet adopted and implemented an explicit national policy concerning men and women workers with family responsibilities in line with the Convention". Trying to assess whether the various measures concerning employment, the family, social services and benefits were sufficient to comprise a national policy was difficult, "especially when many of the measures taken in these areas appear to have been inspired by concerns largely irrelevant to the overall objective of creating effective equality between

\_

<sup>68</sup> ILO, 1993, op.cit. p. 23.

*men and women*". <sup>69</sup> The objective of equality is elusive and it is important to review the design and implementation of measures from the equality point of view.

In addition, the Committee of Expert pointed out "if the measures taken to implement a national policy of equality of opportunity and treatment between men and women are to be effective, they should accompanied by a major campaign of sensibilization in order to promote the widespread acceptance of the notion that the family is the concern of each individual, man and woman, and that society must enable all persons with dependants both to exercise their responsibilities and to participate fully in the labour force" <sup>70</sup>.

## Challenging the models of female carer and male ideal worker

The persistence of the female carer model, which assumes that caring is done by women, also implies that men can continue to behave as ideal workers unencumbered by family responsibilities. Policy orientations which challenge these assumptions are therefore more likely to promote equality. Workplace culture and expectations concerning the ideal worker who puts job and career concerns over any desire for family involvement play a role in discouraging men from taking advantage of entitlements such as parental leave. Fathers may fear that giving some priority to family responsibilities will mean they are seen as less committed to their work and that their career may be affected. For this reason, "It is important that reconciliation measures incorporate elements that address the organizational and attitudinal obstacles that deter male take-up". <sup>71</sup>

Gender equality can be promoted by employers changing their expectations concerning the ideal worker and trying to find ways in which new working practices can take into account both business and personal needs for all employees. Workplace policies such as discouraging excessive working hours and promoting flexibility can reduce the need for measures to accommodate those women who cannot behave as ideal workers and also create the possibility of more equitable sharing of family responsibilities.

It is also important to carefully design legislation in view of equality objectives. Many well-meaning measures designed to reduce work-family conflicts and protect workers with family roles, can turn out, in practice, to reinforce the gender distribution of household responsibilities, perpetuate the ideal worker model, and end up discriminating against women. For example, obliging enterprises to set up childcare centres when they have a certain number of women workers overlooks any possibilities that men might have childcare responsibilities. Commenting on such legislation that exists in a number of countries, the ILO Committee of Experts noted that "measures designed to promote harmonization of work and family responsibilities, such as childcare services, should not be specific to women". Doing so may provide incentives for employers to limit the number of women workers as a means of avoiding legal responsibilities.

Measures providing leave for family care, such as parental leave, are normally available to both men and women. However, they are often taken primarily by women not only because of women's traditional role as carers but also because women's salaries tend to be lower than men's resulting in a smaller loss in family income. Similarly, measures related to working time, in particular part-time work, may also end up reinforcing the traditional division of labour between men and women as women reduce their hours and thus continue to assume primary responsibility for domestic work and childcare. As foreseen in Recommendation No. 165 (Paragraph 21), it is important to ensure that the

-

<sup>69</sup> ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>70</sup> ILO (2002): International labour standards: A global approach, 75th Anniversary of the Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendations, (Geneva, ILO).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>71</sup> Fagan, C. (2004): "Gender and working time in industrialized countries", in J.C. Messenger (ed.): Working time and workers' preferences in industrialized countries: Finding the balance, pp. 108-146 (London, Routledge).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>72</sup> ILO (1999): Direct request made by the Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendations (CEARC) to Guatemala concerning Workers with Family Responsibilities Convention, 1981 (No. 156), (Geneva, ILO). See APPLIS database available at <a href="http://www.ilo.org">http://www.ilo.org</a>.

terms and conditions of part-time work and home work are adequately regulated. Workers with family responsibilities who use these options should not find themselves in vulnerable situations, paying an inordinately high price for assuming essential but unpaid care work. Improving the conditions of these alternative working arrangements will also help to promote them as equally attractive to men and women. Ultimately, the implications of part-time work for gender equality are debatable and depend on national conditions and legislation. But part-time work will almost inevitably continue to be linked to the traditional gender division of household and caring tasks until a significant proportion of men with family responsibilities begins to use this option.

Apart from workers and employers, a wide range of partners beyond the world of work must be involved in improving the organization of society. More suitable opening hours of government services, of schools, and of shops, and improvements in transportation and community services are just some examples of the wide ranging policies indicated earlier in this paper required to support unpaid care work and support efforts to move towards a more equitable sharing of family responsibilities between women and men.

It is when the models of male ideal worker and female carer are challenged – by policies, by enterprises and by individual men and women – that men will have more options to increase their participation in the family and in care and that women will be able to participate in the labour market on more equal terms with men.

Distributing the responsibilities for the care and maintenance of society's members more equally—between the state and families, and within families, between women and men—provide a basis for equality and opportunity for men and women in all spheres of public and private life. Labour standards on workers with family responsibilities and maternity protection articulate the frameworks developed by ILO member States for achieving these goals through labour and social policy.

#### ANNEX: Further reading and resources, ILO

http://www.ilo.org/public/english/protection/condtrav/index.htm

#### **Conditions of Work and Employment Series**

- No. 1: Quality of working life: A review on changes in work organization, conditions of employment and work-life arrangements (2003), by H. Gospel
- No. 2: Sexual harassment at work: National and international responses (2005), by D. McCann
- No. 3: Statistics on working time arrangements based on time-use survey data (2003), by A. S. Harvey, J. Gershuny, K. Fisher and A. Akbari
- No. 4: The definition, classification and measurement of working time arrangements (2003), by D. Bell and P. Elias
- No. 5: Reconciling work and family: Issues and policies in Japan (2003), by M. Abe, C. Hamamoto and S. Tanaka
- No. 6: Reconciling work and family: Issues and policies in the Republic of Korea (2004), by T.H. Kim and K.K. Kim
- No. 7: Domestic work, conditions of work and employment: A legal perspective (2003), by J. M. Ramirez-Machado
- No. 8: Reconciling work and family: Issues and policies in Brazil (2004), by B. Sorj
- No. 9: Employment conditions in an ageing world: Meeting the working time challenge (2004), by A. Jolivet and S. Lee
- No. 10: Designing programmes to improve working and employment conditions in the informal economy: A literature review (2004), by R. Rinehart
- No. 11: Working time in transition: The dual task of standardization and flexibilization in China (2005), by X. Zeng, L. Lu and S.Umar Idris
- No. 12: Compressed working weeks (2006), by P. Tucker
- No. 13: Etude sur le temps de travail et l'organisation du travail au Sénégal: Analyse juridique et enquête auprès des entreprises (2006), by A.I. Ndiaye
- No. 14: Reconciling work and family: Issues and policies in Thailand (2006), by K. Kusakabe
- No. 15: Conditions of work and employment for older workers in industrialized countries: Understanding the issues (2006), by N.S. Ghosheh Jr., S. Lee and D. McCann
- No. 16: Wage fixing in the informal economy: Evidence from Brazil, India, Indonesia and South Africa (2006), by C. Saget
- No. 18: Reconciling work and family: Issues and policies in Trinidad and Tobago (2008), Conditions of Work and Employment Series No. 18, by Dr. Rhoda Reddock and Dr. Yvonne Bobb-Smith
- No. 19: Minding the gaps: Non-regular employment and labour market segmentation in the Republic of Korea (2007), Conditions of Work and Employment Series No.19, by B.-H. Lee and S. Lee

#### Working time and work organization

Etude sur le temps de travail et l'organisation du travail au Sénégal: Analyse juridique et enquête auprès des entreprises (2006), Conditions of Work and Employment Series No. 13, by A.I. Ndiaye

Decent working time: New trends, new issues (2006), by J.-Y. Boulin, M. Lallement, J. C.

Messenger and F. Michon (eds.)

Compressed working weeks (2006), Conditions of Work and Employment Series No. 12, by P. Tucker

Working time laws: A global perspective (2005), by D. McCann

Working time in transition: The dual task of standardization and flexibilization in China (2005), Conditions of Work and Employment Series No. 11, by X. Zeng, L. Lu and S.Umar Idris

Working time and workers' preferences in industrialized countries: Finding the balance (2004), by J.C. Messenger (ed.)

Employment conditions in an ageing world: Meeting the working time challenge (2004), Conditions of Work and Employment Series No. 9, by A. Jolivet and S. Lee

Working time: Its impact on safety and health (2003), by A. Spurgeon

Quality of working life: A review on changes in work organization, conditions of employment and work-life arrangements (2003), Conditions of Work and Employment Series No. 1, by H. Gospel

Statistics on working time arrangements based on time-use survey data (2003), Conditions of Work and Employment Series No. 3, by A. S. Harvey, J. Gershuny, K. Fisher and A. Akbari

The definition, classification and measurement of working time arrangements (2003), Conditions of Work and Employment Series No. 4, by D. Bell and P. Elias

Work organization and ergonomics (1998), by V. Di Martino and N. Corlett

Les évolutions du temps de travail en Europe (1996), by G. Azmar and J-Y. Boulin

L'annualisation du temps de travail en France (1995), by M. Lallement

The development of annual working hours in the United Kingdom (1995), by P. Blyton

Annual working hours in Germany (1995), by G. Bosch and S. Lehndorff

Working time around the world (1995), Conditions of Work Digest, Vol. 14

#### Wages and incomes

#### Global Wage Report 2008 (forthcoming)

Conditions of Work and Employment Series No. 16: Wage fixing in the informal economy: Evidence from Brazil, India, Indonesia and South Africa (2006), by C. Saget

La problématique des niveaux de négociation chez F. Sellier: son apport au débat actuel sur la permanence des modèles centralisés (2005), by F. Eyraud et R. Tchobanian

The fundamentals of minimum wage fixing (2005), F. Eyraud and C. Saget

Can minimum wage policy reduce poverty? Labour Education 2004/1-2, No. 134, special issue on Poverty Reduction Strategy Process (2004), by C. Saget

Labour market institutions and income inequality: What are the new insights after the washington consensus (chapter 8), by R. van der Hoeven and C. Saget, in Inequality, growth and poverty in an era of liberalisation and globalisation (2004), by G.A. Cornia (ed.)

EU enlargement versus social Europe? The uncertain future of the European social model (2003), by D. Vaughan-Whitehead

Minimum wage in Chile: An example of the potential and limitations of this policy instrument (2003), by R. Infante, A. Marinakis and J. Velasco

How to get the maximum out of the minimum wage, in Labour Education 2002/3, No. 128, pp 67-73 (2002), by C. Saget

Poverty reduction and employment in developing countries: Do minimum wages help?, in International Labour Review, Vol. 140, No. 3, pp 237-269, (2001), by C. Saget

Is minimum wage an effective tool to promote decent work and reduce poverty? The experience of selected developing countries (2001), by C. Saget

The determinants of female labour supply in Hungary, in Economics of Transition, Vol. 7, No. 3, pp. 575-591, (1999), by C. Saget

Albania in crisis: The predictable fall of the shining star (1999), by D. Vaughan-Whitehead

Systems of public sector remuneration in six OECD countries (Canada, France, Germany, Great Britain, Italy, United States): Comparative and analytical study (1998), by Y. Ghellab and N. Laniel

Paying the price: The wage crisis in Central and Eastern Europe (1998), by D. Vaughan-Whitehead (ed.)

Workers' financial participation: East-west experiences (1995), by D. vaughan-Whitehead et al.

Minmum wages in Central and Eastern Europe: From protection to destitution (1995), by D. Vaughan-Whitehead and G. Standing (eds.)

Les formes hiérarchiques: Travail et salaires dans neuf pays industrialisés (1994), by F. Eyraud and P. Rozenblatt

La régulation des salaires dans le secteur public: Essai de comparaison internationale France, Grande-Bretagne, Italie (1993), by F. Eyraud and J.J. Silvestre

Equal pay protection in industrialised market economies: In search of greater effectiveness (1993), by F. Eyraud et al.

Civil service pay in Africa (1990), by D. Robinson

#### Work and family

Report on Work and Family in developing countries 2009 (forthcoming)

Workplace partnerships for childcare solutions 2009(forthcoming)

La maternidad sin riesgo y el mundo del trabajo (2008), Programa sobre las condiciones de trabajo y del empleo

Maternité sans risques et le monde du travail (2008), Programme des conditions de travail et d'emploi

Safe Maternity and the world of work (2007), Conditions of Work and Employment Programme

Reconciling work and family: Issues and policies in Thailand (2006), Conditions of Work and Employment Series No.14, by K. Kusakabe

Maternity at work: A review of national legislation (2005), by I. Öun and G. Pardo Trujillo

Reconciling work and family responsibilities: Practical ideas from global experience (2005), by C. Hein

Reconciling work and family: Issues and policies in Brazil (2004), Conditions of Work and Employment Series No. 8, by B. Sorj

How are workers with family responsibilities faring in the workplace? (2004), by J. Heymann

Reconciling work and family: Issues and policies in the Republic of Korea (2004), Conditions of Work and Employment Series No. 6, by T.H. Kim and K.K. Kim

## Healthy beginnings: Guidance on safe maternity at work (2004), by J. Paul

Reconciling work and family: Issues and policies in Japan (2003), Conditions of Work and Employment Series No. 5, by M. Abe, C. Hamamoto and S. Tanaka

Maternity protection at work, Report IV(2B) (2000)

Maternity protection at work, Report IV(2A) (2000)

Maternity protection at work, Report IV(1) (1999)

Maternity protection at work, Report V(2) (1999)

Maternity protection at work, Report V(1) (1997)

Combining work and elder care: A challenge for now and the future (1996), by I. Hoskins

Maternity and work (1994), Conditions of Work Digest, Vol. 13

#### **Working conditions**

Designing programmes to improve working and employment conditions in the informal economy: A literature review (2004), Conditions of Work and Employment Series No. 10, by R. Rinehart

Company cases and cross-company initiatives: Working conditions improvement in Haiti (2003), by V. Di Martino, S. Filippi and C. Loiselle

Work organization and ergonomics (1998), by V. Di Martino and N. Corlett

Improving working conditions and productivity in the garment industry: Action manual (1998), by J. C. Hiba (ed.)

Stress prevention for blue-collar workers in assembly-line production (1997), by S. Kvanström

Protection of workers' personal data: An ILO code of practice (1997)

Work-related stress in nursing: Controlling the risk to health (1996), by T. Cox, A. Griffiths and S. Cox

Bus drivers: Occupational stress and stress prevention (1996), by M.A.J. Kompier

Stress prevention in the offshore oil and gas exploration and production industry (1996), by V.J. Sutherland and C.L. Cooper

Occupational stress and stress prevention in air traffic control (1995), by G. Costa

Action programmes for the protection of homeworkers (1995), by U. Huws

Employment of homeworkers: Examples of good practice (1995), by U. Huws and S. Podro

Workers' privacy: Part III: Testing in the workplace (1993), *Conditions of Work Digest*, Vol. 12, No. 2

Workers' privacy: Part II: Monitoring and surveillance in the workplace (1993), *Conditions of Work Digest*, Vol 12, No. 1

Workers' Privacy: Part I: Protection of personal data (1991), *Conditions of Work Digest*, Vol. 10, No. 2

Higher productivity and a better place to work: Action manual (1988), by J.E. Thurman, K. Kogi and A.E. Louzine

Higher productivity and a better place to work: Trainers' manual (1988), by J.E. Thurman, K. Kogi and A.E. Louzine

#### Workplace violence and harassment

Violence at work (Third edition, 2006), by D. Chappell and V. Di Martin

Sexual harassment at work: National and international responses (2005), Conditions of Work and Employment Series No. 2, by D. McCann

Preventing and responding to violence at work (2003), by K. Rogers and D. Chappell

Action against sexual harassment at work in Asia and the Pacific (2001), by N. Haspels, Z. Mohamed Kasim, C. Thomas and D. McCann

Report on the ILO/Japan Regional Tripartite Seminar on action against sexual harassment at work in Asia and the Pacific (Penang, Malaysia, 2-4 October 2001) (2001)

Action against sexual harassment at work in Asia and the Pacific (Technical Report for discussion at the ILO/Japan Regional Tripartite Seminar on Action against Sexual Harassment at Work in Asia and the Pacific (Penang, Malaysia, 2-4 October 2001) (2001)

Violence at work (Second edition, 2000), by D. Chappell and V. Di Martino

Sexual harassment: Addressing sexual harassment in the workplace – A management information booklet (1999), by A. Reinhart

Annotated bibliography on violence at work (1999)

Annotated bibliography on sexual harassment at work (1999)

Sectoral Activities Programme working papers on violence in services sectors

#### **Cross-cutting research**

Working Conditions Laws 2006-2007 (2008), by E. Evain

Food at work: Workplace solutions for malnutrition, obesity and chronic diseases (2005), by C. Wanjek

Working and employment conditions in new EU Member States: Convergence or diversity? (2005), by D. Vaughan-Whitehead (ed.)

Domestic work, conditions of work and employment: A legal perspective (2003), Conditions of Work and Employment Series No. 7, by J. M. Ramirez-Machado

Report On Domestic Workers (Forthcoming)

ANNEX II. Ratifications of ILO Convention No. 156

Country	Ratification date	Status
<u>Albania</u>	11:10:2007	ratified
<u>Argentina</u>	17:03:1988	ratified
<u>Australia</u>	30:03:1990	ratified
Belize	22:06:1999	ratified
Bolivia	01:09:1998	ratified
Bosnia and Herzegovina	02:06:1993	ratified
Bulgaria	03:04:2006	ratified
<u>Chile</u>	14:10:1994	ratified
Croatia	08:10:1991	ratified
El Salvador	12:10:2000	ratified
<b>Ethiopia</b>	28:01:1991	ratified
<u>Finland</u>	09:02:1983	ratified
<u>France</u>	16:03:1989	ratified
Greece	10:06:1988	ratified
<u>Guatemala</u>	06:01:1994	ratified
Guinea	16:10:1995	ratified
<u>Iceland</u>	22:06:2000	ratified
<u>Japan</u>	09:06:1995	ratified
Republic of Korea	29:03:2001	ratified
<u>Lithuania</u>	06:05:2004	ratified
The former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia	17:11:1991	ratified
Mauritius	05:04:2004	ratified
Montenegro	03:06:2006	ratified
<u>Netherlands</u>	24:03:1988	ratified
Niger	05:06:1985	ratified
Norway	22:06:1982	ratified
Paraguay	21:12:2007	ratified

<u>Peru</u>	16:06:1986	ratified
<b>Portugal</b>	02:05:1985	ratified
<b>Russian Federation</b>	13:02:1998	ratified
San Marino	19:04:1988	ratified
<u>Serbia</u>	24:11:2000	ratified
Slovakia	14.06.2002	ratified
Slovenia	29:05:1992	ratified
<u>Spain</u>	11:09:1985	ratified
Sweden	11:08:1982	ratified
<u>Ukraine</u>	11:04:2000	ratified
<u>Uruguay</u>	16:11:1989	ratified
<b>Bolivarian Republic of Venezuela</b>	27:11:1984	ratified
<u>Yemen</u>	13:03:1989	ratified

 $\begin{array}{c} \text{Ratified:} \\ 40 \end{array} \quad \begin{array}{c} \text{Conditional ratification: 0} \\ \end{array} \quad \begin{array}{c} \text{Declared} \\ \text{applicable: 0} \\ \end{array} \quad \begin{array}{c} \text{Denounced:} \\ 0 \end{array}$ 

Source: ILOLEX http://www.ilo.org/ilolex/